

WHOSE MUSIC? OWNERSHIP AND IDENTITY IN JEWISH MUSIC

Ruth Rosenfelder*

The specific effect of music on the human mind has been explored by clinical psychiatrist Oliver Sacks, and responses to music have been examined by social philosophers such as Theodor Adorno. Their findings reveal the importance of music both on a personal level and as a social indicator. It would therefore seem axiomatic that music is a defining constituent in the taxonomy of any culture, whilst religious music, with integrated elements of spirituality, is particularly powerful in emoting direct and profound response and recognition. The biblical text indicates the centrality of music in all aspects of daily as well as religious life, although evidence of musical notation or of the sounds of chant or melody, sacred or other, has yet to come to light. The post-Biblical addition of a 2000 year Diaspora in which Jewish communities were established throughout the world, implies an additional absorption of the musics of a variety of host societies. Nevertheless, the tropes of Ashkenazi liturgy as well as genres such as Klezmer and the folk music of both Ashkenazi and Sephardi European Jewry are generally regarded as identifiably 'Jewish'. This paper explores attitudes to musical appropriation and intercultural exchange in religious, para-liturgical and domestic music, and also considers notions of 'sacred' and 'profane' in a Jewish musical context, with particular emphasis on Hasidic religious ideology and the Sephardi women's folk tradition.

Whose Music? Ownership and Identity in Jewish Music

The effect of music is not merely powerful but arguably evokes the most visceral of human responses. Social philosophers such as Theodor Adorno explore reactions to music in theoretical terms whilst the neurologist Oliver Sacks describes physical manifestations caused by the effects of music, both known and unknown, on his patients.¹ In the case of music that is familiar, Sacks states that the melody, 'acts as a Proustian mnemonic ... giving the patient access to moods and memories ... that had seemingly been completely lost'.

In many religions, music, in the form of hymns, anthems, incantations or chants, is a vital element in attempting to achieve spirituality. In the case of Judaism, probably the most universally recognized Jewish liturgical melody is that sung to the prayer *Kol Nidrei* at the start of the most solemn day in the Jewish calendar, *Yom Kippur*. It is one of approximately ten melodies that are sung during the *Yomim Norayim* (Heb. 'High Holydays' using traditional Ashkenazi pronunciation); the origins of these melodies are unknown but are believed to be so ancient as to warrant the title *Mi Sinai* (Heb. 'From Sinai').² Whilst regarded as belonging

* Visiting Lecturer in Jewish Music Studies, City University, London. Email: r.rosenfelder@city.ac.uk

¹ Theodor Adorno, *Beethoven: The Philosophy of Music* (Palo Alto: Stanford University Press, 1997). Oliver Sacks, *Musophilia* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 2007), 344–347.

² See 'Mi Sinai Niggunim', *Encyclopedia Judaica*, (Israel: CD Rom Edition, Israel: Judaica Multimedia Ltd., 1997).

within the relative confines of the *Ashkenazi* tradition, general awareness of the *Kol Nidrei*³ melody has extended well beyond a specific Jewish group or even the context of Sacred Service to become a Jewish melodic marker for Jew and non-Jew alike.⁴ Thus, this traditional *Ashkenazi* melody may be described as having travelled from the Synagogue into the general musical soundscape whilst maintaining a Jewish identity.

In the context of Sacred Service, music is fundamental to Judaism. With few exceptions, prayers are either chanted or sung, with certain melodies or modes associated with particular festivals, Sabbath or week-day prayers and Torah readings as well as para-liturgical songs and hymns that are sung in the home to celebrate life and annual cycles. However, as a result of the 2000 year Jewish Diaspora, the notion of an essentially, definable ‘Jewish’ melody is, as demonstrated by the *Kol Nidrei* paradigm, confused by a complex host of musical traditions that now obtain, when setting texts that are often common to all Jewish communities. Thus, implicit differences between, for example, Yemenite and Polish melodies for settings of identical liturgy or Biblical text would indicate inevitable external musical influences.

The Bible, Judaism’s primary source, provides many references to music and its practice, but there is as yet no evidence to indicate any melodic structures and surprisingly, given the importance of written documentation demonstrated by Biblical text, there remains a continued absence of any indication of written musical notation.⁵ This lack of information encourages many forms of speculation as to instrumentation and general performance practice, particularly in Temple service, since the many references and Talmudic discussions on Temple music indicate its importance.⁶ Additionally, there remains a generally held belief that until the actual Temple melodies can be confirmed, all melody, non-sacred as well as religious, must be considered as possibly deriving from Temple sources and should therefore not be regarded as unacceptable.⁷

Hasidism and Music

Acknowledgement of the validity of all melody is further endorsed within Hasidic philosophy, which regards the sacred and profane as inextricably bound together.⁸ Thus, a holistic vision

³ *Kol Nidrei* (Aramaic. lit ‘All Vows’) is the prayer which heralds *Yom Kippur* (Heb. ‘Day of Atonement’), the holiest day in the Jewish calendar.

⁴ Arguably the most notable example of the *Kol Nidre* melody as thematic material in Western Art music for a non-Jewish composer is *Kol Nidre*, Op.47 for Cello and Orchestra, by Max Bruch (1838–1920). Composed in Liverpool in 1880, in response to a commission from the Liverpool Jewish community, it was first published in Berlin in 1881 and continues to enjoy general popularity in the concert hall and the recording studio.

⁵ The discovery, during the middle of the twentieth century, of Mesopotamian cuneiform tablets indicating instrumental tunings and probable musical systems offers encouragement that recorded Ancient Hebrew musical notational system may also be discovered. See particularly the works of Anne Kilmer, Emeritus Professor of Assyriology, University of California at Berkeley, for example ‘The Discovery of an Ancient Theory of Mesopotamian Music’, *Proceedings of the American Philosophical Society*, 1971, and Joachim Braun, Emeritus Professor of Music, Bar-Ilan University, an example being, J. Braun, *Music in Ancient Israel/Palestine: Archeological, Written and Comparative Sources* (Grand Rapids, Michigan: Eerdmans Publications, 2002).

⁶ See, for example, Babelonian Talmud, tractate *Sukkah* 50a, 50b and 51a

⁷ Expressed by the scholar and teacher, Rabbi S. Sperber, personal communication with this author in 1961 (exact date unknown) who held the post of the Jewish Agency’s Director at the Department for Torah and Education and Culture in London.

⁸ For general discussion of Hasidic principles see ‘Hasidism’, *Encyclopedia Judaica* (1997).

for physical and spiritual well-being. It is therefore totally acceptable to adopt a street or folk song and exalt it by adapting it to the glory of God. There are stories of Hasidic *Rebbs* hearing shepherds in the countryside or organ-grinders in the town singing an attractive song. Typically, the *Rebbe* would ask the singer to teach him the song, sometimes in exchange for a sum of money. As soon as the *Rebbe* had learnt it, the organ grinder or shepherd would forget the melody. Association with the *Rebbe* would then elevate the melody from the mundane to the spiritual. In a brief summary of Hasidic music, writer and musician Velvel Pasternak describes the criticism made by music scholars and opponents of Hasidism that Hasidic music includes what he characterises as ‘foreign elements’.⁹ He adds, however, that:

the strains of shepherd melodies ... in no way harmed the sanctity of the melody, for the essence of a *nigun* (Hasidic melody) is the sound, and if the sound is derived from an impure source, there is a duty to elevate, purify and sanctify it until it is worthy of the responsibility for which it was created.¹⁰

In Hasidic philosophy, non-texted melody is regarded as superior to texted song, as confirmed by Rabbi Shneur Zalman, the first Lubavitcher Rebbe, when he acknowledged, ‘The tongue is the pen of the heart, but melody is the pen of the soul’.¹¹ Untexted music is regarded as a direct conduit between God and Man without the intervention and therefore distraction of the human word. Thus, the frequent occurrence of vocables such as ‘*Ya bi bom*’ or ‘*Oy yoy yoy*’ in place of text in Hasidic song allows the singer to concentrate on melody alone when attempting contemplation to achieve a desired state of ecstasy in prayer.

In pre-World War II Eastern Europe, it appears that adoption of local musical idioms as part of a particular Hasidic group’s tradition was not unusual. An example may be found in the compositions by twenty-first century Satmar composers in the traditional style of Satmar *nigun*. Four new melodies are created annually for the *Yomim Neroyim*; these are sung wordlessly but each is associated with a specific High Holyday prayer. The style of the compositions imitates that of the 1930s melodies of Berish Wischower, the Satmarer *Rebbe*’s official composer; each year one is in the style of the folk or popular dance idioms that existed in Austria, Germany, Switzerland and Bohemia, such as the polka or the three-beat *Ländler*, which is thought to be the precursor of the waltz. In an unusual addition of a written liner note to the melodies composed in 2002, the anonymous author describes, in Yiddish, the new compositions as directly deriving from the Wischower Satmar tradition but with no reference to possible melodic origins.¹² Nevertheless, there is an implied presumption that within the canon of Hasidic *nigun* there exists recognizably ‘Satmar’ melodies, albeit unrecorded on paper.

⁹ Eli Lipsker and Velvel Pasternak, *Chabad Melodies: Songs of the Lubavitcher Chassidim* (Baltimore: Tara Publications, 1997), 8.

¹⁰ *Ibid.*

¹¹ Author unknown, quoted in the notes accompanying cassette recording of Lubavitch *nigunim*, *The Rebbe’s Nigunim* (New York: Y&M Music Productions, 1995), 1. For discussion on wordless *nigun*, including particular references to Lubavitch philosophy, see Chemjo Vinaver, *Anthology of Hassidic Music* (Jerusalem: Hebrew University of Jerusalem, 1985), 220–223.

¹² *Nigunei Satmar*, CDD #103 (no further attribution). Two examples of melodies which include Austro-Hungarian folk elements appear on the audio-cassette; one of the melodies is by Wischower. Chemjo Vinaver describes the general Hasidic response to written as opposed to oral transmission of knowledge as ‘blasphemy’. Vinaver, *Anthology of Hassidic Music*, 18. Whilst this understanding may be regarded as rather extreme, written sleeve notes appear very rarely to accompany audio-recordings of Satmar *nigunim*.

By contrast, the Lubavitch tradition of recorded scholarship as well the group's history of interaction with peoples outside its own community identifies it as *sui generis* within the Hasidic community. The Lubavitch approach includes acknowledgement of the source of some of its melodies, an example of which is the meditative, wordless *nigun* known as *Shamil's nigun*. Shamil, a nineteenth century Muslim anti-Russian resistance leader based in the Caucasus, was imprisoned by the Russians. Whilst there, he sang a plaintive melody which could be heard from outside his cell and which was subsequently absorbed into the Lubavitch canon of *nigun*.¹³ Parallels are drawn between the song representing Shamil's desire for freedom which, as a Lubavitch *nigun*, becomes an expression of the soul's wish to escape the bonds of the human body and return to the freedom of spiritual oneness with God. Now widely known amongst members of Lubavitch, *Shamil's Nigun* was taught by the seventh and most recent Lubavitcher Rebbe, Rabbi Menachem-Mendel Schneerson, known to his followers as the *Rebbe*, in 1958 as part of a drive to reintroduce forgotten Lubavitch melodies and build up a canon of Lubavitch *nigunim*.¹⁴ A two-volume collection of 347 melodies includes words and music, written in five-line Western stave notation, and includes explanatory notes to some of the *nigunim* (pl.).¹⁵

Texted *nigunim* are generally in Hebrew, often taken from liturgical or Biblical sources, replacing the original lyrics if the melody derives from a folk-song. However, a further example of a Lubavitch exception to Hasidic norms is the *nigun*, *Essen Est Zich*.¹⁶ The words of the song are in Yiddish, East European Jewry's vernacular, which is unusual for a *nigun*, particularly one of this meditative character. Regarded as a melody to aid concentration in prayer, it is thought to derive from a Russian drinking song, a notion born out by textual references to eating and drinking, '*Essen est zich trinken trinkt zich vos zol men ton az es davent zich nit essen est zich shlofn shloft zich vos zol men ton az es davent zich nit*' (Yidd. 'Eating is simple, drinking is simple, what's to be done if one can't pray; eating is easy, sleeping is easy, what's do be done if one can't pray'). For the Lubavitch member with a problem concerned with prayer, the advice is to substitute prayers for the text in this slow meditative melody with its mantra-like chant. However, a change of tempo transforms the *nigun* from contemplation to rhythmic joy, particularly when it is sung in company at a meal or celebration.

A particularly interesting melody that the *Rebbe* revived is one that sets the words taken from the liturgy, sung in Synagogue on Sabbaths and festivals, '*Ho'aderes veho'emunah*' (Heb. 'Power and trustworthiness') juxtaposed with Hasidic 'lai la lai'. In 1973, The *Rebbe*, who had studied in France, presented the melody that was then no longer in use, explaining that the first *Lubavitcher Rebbe*, Rabbi Shneur Zalman of Lyadi, heard it sung by Napoleon's army during its Russian campaign and had asked for it to be sung to him. It is in fact the melody to the *Marseilles*, which by adoption, the first *Lubavitcher Rebbe* transformed into a holy melody, a typical example of cultural and spiritual transformation. In 1992, the *Rebbe* returned to the subject of the melody and a recent further transformation it had undergone. He began by reminding his followers that they had begun to sing the melody of the French national anthem to religious text in 1973. He continued,

¹³ The melody can be heard on cassette audio-recording, *The Rebbe's Nigunim* (1995).

¹⁴ The *Rebbe* died in 1994 without a successor.

¹⁵ Samuel Zalmanoff, *Sefer Hanigunim* (Brooklyn: Nichoach, no date).

¹⁶ For the *nigun* see Samuel Zalmanoff, *Sefer Hanigunim*, 1:109, 97. Transliterated Yiddish text, traditionally written in Hebrew characters, is taken from Lipsker, *Chabad Melodies*, 45.

A short while later... an incredible phenomenon transpired: the French people, in compliance with their Prime Minister's suggestion, modified the melody and softened its rhythm... What had induced this spontaneous change? When the *nigun* had been transformed into holiness, the heavenly angel and spiritual source of the nation of France perceived the transformation. This triggered the sudden reaction to alter the song, resulting from the inherent realisation of their spiritual source, that this anthem which had previously embodied the French nation is no longer exclusively theirs. It now belongs to the domain of holiness.¹⁷

The *Rebbe* acknowledges not merely the origins of the Marseilles, but that it remains as the country's anthem. It is not therefore a case of total religious transformation as in the examples of the shepherd forgetting the melody once it has been elevated to spiritual levels. What the *Rebbe* declares is that by adopting the melody, presumably without the awareness of any French official or politician, Lubavitch has prompted a softening in the French national psyche. The melody is therefore no longer the sole property of the French; because of Lubavitch's intervention, it has attained a spiritual universality as well as a shared identity. The notion of melody as an essentialist nationalist marker is thus denied in favour of melody as a supernatural phenomenon that can be adapted through spiritual intervention.

The Tradition of Sephardi Women's Music

The *Rebbe's* revival of Lubavitch *nigunim* was part of a programme to regenerate the group's endangered traditions in the wake of World War II and its relocation to the United States. Acts to preserve threatened religious and cultural practices run like a *leitmotif* throughout Jewish history, such as the additional readings to those of the Torah instigated by Ezra as a result of the Babylonian exile, or *Yehudah Ha' Nasi's* redaction of the *Mishnah* and the subsequent recording of dialectics in the *Talmud*. In the context of this paper, the tradition of women's folksong, particularly that of Sephardi women, who originated from the Iberian Peninsula, is of particular relevance. The demonstration of intercultural exchange, or indeed its absence, through music, is advanced by the musicologist Abraham Zvi Idelsohn. He argues that confinement to the ghetto endured by generations of Ashkenazi communities caused them to turn inward, essentially to the music of the Synagogue, for their folk and domestic melodies.¹⁸ Ashkenazi liturgical melodies and motifs, although essentially an orally sustained tradition, developed into recognizable *Shtayger* (Yidd. lit. 'Scales'), modes that evolved from motifs and melodies associated with particular prayers. Although Ashkenazi women scarcely attended synagogue, they developed their own body of Yiddish written supplications, known as *t'khines*, as well as Yiddish translations of epic poems and ballads which they shaped to relate to particularly Jewish concerns. Ashkenazi women's literacy, at a time when few men and fewer women were generally capable of reading, is demonstrated by the particular Hebrew characters they used for their Yiddish writings. The cursive script they adopted became so recognizable that it came to be known as *Wayber-taytsch* (Yidd.

¹⁷ Taken from notes accompanying *The Rebbe's Nigunim*, 18. An official at the Ministry of Culture in Paris confirmed that, on taking office in 1974, President Giscard d'Estang initiated a change of orchestration to soften the composition's martial elements. The new version was first played at his inauguration ceremony at the Arc de Triomphe and was subsequently adopted. The official added, however, that she thought the trend was towards reverting to the original instrumentation. Personal telephone communication (3 May 2000).

¹⁸ Abraham Z. Idelsohn, *Jewish Music: Its Historical Development*, (New York: Schocken Books, 1967), 379.

‘women’s version’).¹⁹ It may be assumed that the verses were either sung or chanted to existing melodies, particularly since some *tkhines* have indications in their sub-headings naming the tune of a song to which the supplication should be sung. Nevertheless, there would seem to be little melodic evidence that may safely be solely associated with the Ashkenazi women’s body of songs. What is certain however is that the texts that Ashkenazi women sang were in Yiddish and would have therefore been translated and adapted from any non-Ashkenazi source such as the *minnesinger* or other street singers.

By contrast, the songs of their Sephardi counterparts would appear to have been sung exactly as they heard them in the streets of medieval Spain and have remained intact until the present. This occurred, in spite of, or perhaps because of, their expulsion from Spain and Portugal, possibly demonstrating their need to retain a defined identity as a doubly displaced Diaspora minority group. Following their expulsion in the last decade of the 15th century, Sephardi communities were established throughout Europe, into Greece, the Balkans, and North Africa, side by side with existing Jewish communities. The Sephardim took with them a written corpus of medieval poetry, *piyyutim* (Heb. ‘liturgical poems’) written mainly in Hebrew or Aramaic, many of which would eventually become incorporated into Synagogue liturgy and the para-liturgical hymns sung in the homes within both Ashkenazi as well as Sephardi tradition. Sephardi folk and domestic music was, by contrast passed down orally and stemmed from the street songs that would have been sung by the *joglars* and *segrels*, the Iberian equivalent of the German *minnesinger* or the French *troubadours* and *jongleurs*. The language of Sephardi songs contrasts with Europe’s Ashkenazi communities whose isolation within Russia and Poland is demonstrated in the development of a specifically Jewish argot, *Yiddish*, based on German but with much additional Hebrew. Whilst German was the second language of the educated classes in those countries under Austro-Hungarian rule, it was not generally Eastern Europe vernacular, and certainly not in countries within the Russian Empire where French was generally the second language.

In marked difference, Sephardi cultural integration is indicated by the fact that Sephardi Judeo-Spanish vernacular, *Judezmo*, referred to as Ladino, was essentially Castilian Spanish to which occasional Hebrew or Aramaic words were added.²⁰ The songs were therefore repeated as heard, unlike those of the Ashkenazi communities, which were translated into Yiddish. For almost four hundred years, until the late 19th century when ethnographers wrote down the verses (in Hebrew script), identical Sephardi songs have been orally transmitted from mother to daughter in communities as far afield as Turkey, Morocco, Bosnia, Greece, and Holland. Because it is an oral tradition, textual variations occur, with adaptations that may include Jewish references. Rather more remarkable is the number of texts that remain unchanged, sung to identical melodies common amongst the widely spread Sephardi communities, and indicating extraordinary tenacity in identifying with a culture from which the Jews suffered persecution and ultimate expulsion. The essentialist element in the Sephardi domestic canon of song lies both in melody and language. Thus in her version of one of the best known songs of the repertoire, *Durme Durme*, Flory Jagoda, who

¹⁹ See Ruth Gay, *The Jews of Germany* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1992), 72–80. Also, Devra Kaye, *Seyder Tkhines: The Forgotten Book of Common Prayer for Jewish Women* (Philadelphia: The Jewish Publication Society, 2004).

²⁰ For references to research into the history of the language of Portuguese Jewry and its absence from the Sephardi corpus of domestic song see www.jewish-languages.org/judeo-portuguese.html

now lives in California but who was born in Sarajevo, demonstrates that the song is a Jewish lullaby.²¹

<i>Durme durme izhiko de Madre</i>	Sleep, sleep, Mother's little boy
<i>Durme durme sin ansia dolor</i>	<i>Sleep free from worry and pain</i>
<i>Sienti joya palavrikas de tu Madre</i>	<i>Listen, my joy, to your Mother's words</i>
<i>Las palavras di Shema Yisrael</i>	<i>The words of the Shema Yisrael</i>
<i>Durme durme izhiko de Madre</i>	Sleep, Mother's little boy
<i>Con ermozura de Shema Yisrael</i>	With the beauty of the <i>Shema Yisrael</i>

However, apart from the two references to the *Shema* which puts the lullaby firmly into the context of Jewish night prayer, the language remains essentially that of medieval Castillian.

The text is, however, a version of a song that has no Jewish allusions and is demonstrably an adult love-song. The performer, Judy Frankel, describes the song as taught to her by two Sephardi women, Selma Mizrahi and Sara Levi, who both hail from the Greek island of Rhodes.²² The melody is identical to that sung by Jagody, and whilst the language remains Castillian Spanish, the absence of anything Jewish in the text suggests that this is the original song on which Jagoda's text is based. In this version the lyrics describe a rather dark song of unrequited love.

<i>Durme, durme</i>	Sleep, sleep
<i>Mi alma donzella</i>	<i>My beautiful damsel.</i>
<i>Durme, durme</i>	Sleep, sleep
<i>Sin ansia y dolor.</i>	<i>Without worry or sorrow.</i>

<i>Heq tu sclavo tanto dezea</i>	Here is your slave who only wishes
<i>Ver tu sueño con grande amor</i>	To watch over your sleep with the greatest of love
<i>Ver tu sueño con grande amor.</i>	To watch over your sleep with the greatest of love.
<i>Hay dos años que sufre mi alma</i>	For two years my soul has been suffering
<i>Por ti, joya, mi Linda dama</i>	For you, my jewel, my lovely lady
<i>Por ti, joya, mi Linda dama.</i>	For you, my jewel, my lovely lady.

<i>Siente, siente al son de mi guitarra</i>	Listen, listen to the sound of my guitar
<i>Siente, hermosa, mis males cantar</i>	Listen my lovely to my sad song
<i>Siente, hermosa, mis males cantar.</i>	Listen my lovely to my sad song. ²³

By adhering in this extraordinary way to the songs of medieval Spain, the dispersed Sephardi have inevitably become custodians of a body of songs that might otherwise have been lost. Thus, anyone wishing to investigate the folk music of medieval Spain is encouraged to visit the canon of Sephardi women's music as a primary source, creating a 21st Century position in which medieval Castillian folk music goes under the rubric of the Sephardi tradition. This open acknowledgement of Jewish ownership of melody and text that was originally Spanish would seem the result of four hundred years of careful preservation that might not have existed had not the Jews of the Iberian peninsula been expelled from their homes. Attempts by expatriate groups to preserve their culture are regularly documented, but what is

²¹ For Jagody's *Durme, Durme* see *Kantikas di Mi Nona (Songs of my Grandmother)* Audio CD, Global Village B00003A9PO (30 April 1996).

²² Judy Frankel, *Stairway of Gold: Songs of the Sephardim*, Audio CD, Global Video B00008GQJ12 (19 October 1995).

²³ Translation taken from liner notes for Frankel Audio CD (1995).

remarkable in this instance is that the texts and melodies that remained so similar were orally transmitted in diverse communities throughout Europe and North Africa.

Conclusion

The examples of Hasidic *nigun* appear to demonstrate that Hasidic philosophy attaches considerable significance to music whilst at the same time allowing that the sanctity assigned to a melody lies in its use rather than itself. In the main, once a melody is adopted as a spiritual vehicle it becomes elevated and may not be relegated to its former status, although there are examples where the origins are recognized and recorded. In the unusual case of the Lubavitch adoption of the *Marseillaise*, the group goes further in its belief that the melody's application as a *nigun* has a mystical effect on its reception as a national anthem. In this instance the sanctity attached to the music's acquired status influences its reception in its original role.

Within the rather different area of folk melody, the example of Sephardi women's song presents a case of musical adoption and maintenance which would seem to indicate the group's desire to sustain the memory of previous cultural integration. By their act of preservation, the women of the dispersed Sephardi communities became the custodians of a medieval Iberian folk tradition and language that was dissipated by natural evolution within Spain. By tenaciously retaining the medieval songs and ballads, the dispersed communities appear to have authentically reproduced the medieval songs of Castillian Spain, since the widely placed communities continue to sing near identical text to identical melody. However, rather than described as custodians of a Spanish tradition, Sephardi women are regarded as possessors of their own essential recognizable body of folk-song convention. Thus the Hasidic and the Sephardi paradigms identify processes by which music, although initially adopted, has become identifiably theirs.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Adorno, Theodor, *Beethoven: The Philosophy of Music* (Palo Alto, Stanford University Press, 1997).
- Braun, Joachim, *Music in Ancient Israel/Palestine: Archeological, Written and Comparative Sources* (Grand Rapids, Michigan: Eerdmans Publications, 2002).
- Gay, Ruth, *The Jews of Germany* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1992).
- Idelsohn, Abraham Zvi, *Jewish Music: Its Historical Development* (New York: Schocken Books, 1967).
- Kaye, Devra, *Seyder Tkhines: The Forgotten Book of Common Prayer for Jewish Women* (Philadelphia: The Jewish Publication Society, 2004).
- Kilmer, Anne, 'The Discovery of an Ancient Theory of Mesopotamian Music', *Proceedings of the American Philosophical Society* (1971).
- Lipsker, Eli, and Velvel Pasternak, *Chabad Melodies: Songs of the Lubavitcher Chassidim* (Baltimore: Tara Publications, 1997).
- '*Mi Sinai Niggunim*', *Encyclopedia Judaica* (Israel: CD Rom Edition, Israel: Judaica Multimedia Ltd., 1997).
- Sacks, Oliver, *Musicophilia* (New York, Alfred A. Knopf, 2007).
- Vinaver, Chemjo, *Anthology of Hassidic Music* (Jerusalem: Hebrew University of Jerusalem, 1985).
- Zalmanoff, Samuel, *Sefer Hanigunim*, 2 vols (Brooklyn: Nichoach, no date).

Web-Sites

www.jewish-languages.org/judeo-portuguese.html

Personal Communication

French Ministry of Culture Official. *Personal telephone communication with this author* (3 May 2000).

Sperber, S. *Personal communication with this author* (1961).

Discography

Frankel, Judy, *Stairway of Gold: Songs of the Sephardim*, Audio CD, Global Video B00008GQ12 (19 October 1995).

Jagoda, Flory, *Kantikas Di Mi Nona*, Audio CD, Global Village B00003A0PO (30 April 1996).

Nigunei Satmar 5733. Audio Cassette, CDD #103 (no further attribution).

Yidel Werzberger, *Nigunei Yomim Noroyim*. Audio Cassette (New York: 5735 Autumn 2004).

The Rebbe's Nigunim. Audio Cassette (New York: Y&M Music Productions, 1995).