Table of Contents

Section I – Relationship Between CMEA Bay Section and Adjudicators ..................3
Section II – Adjudicator Qualifications ..................................................................................3
Section III – Training and Evaluation .....................................................................................4
Section IV – Adjudicator Duties and Responsibilities .................................................................6
Section V – Head Adjudicator ..................................................................................................9
Section VI – Mentor Adjudicators ..........................................................................................10
Section VII – Standards ...........................................................................................................11
Section VIII – Recommended Procedures for Adjudicator’s Comments .........................12
Section IX – Ratings Standards ................................................................................................13
Section X – Awarded Ratings ....................................................................................................14
The Bay Section of California Music Educators Association (“CMEA Bay Section”) has a two-fold responsibility: first, to the student and director; and second, to the professional educator or musician who is willing to perform services as an Adjudicator.

The Adjudication Guidelines which follow are intended to outline what is to be expected by participating students from both the adjudication process itself and from the assigned Adjudicator, as well as clarify the responsibilities of students and directors throughout the adjudication process.

I. RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN CMEA BAY SECTION AND ADJUDICATORS
   A. An Adjudicator is an independent contractor of CMEA Bay Section and nothing in these Adjudication Guidelines, the Festival Adjudicator Contract, the CMEA Bay Section Handbook, or any related materials, shall be construed to create a joint venture, partnership, agency or other employment relationship between Adjudicator and CMEA Bay Section.
   B. An Adjudicator shall be solely responsible for his or her conduct and for the conduct of his or her agents, if any, in regard to the fulfillment of the purposes of the Festival Adjudicator Contract and the Adjudicator shall indemnify CMEA Bay Section and hold it harmless against any loss or expense, including reasonable attorney fees, arising out of any claim for personal injury or property damage claimed to have been sustained by any third party as a result of any act or omission on the part of the Adjudicator and his or her agent, if any.
   C. There shall be no deduction from the fees paid to the Adjudicator for any employment-related taxes, and CMEA Bay Section shall furnish to the Adjudicator at the conclusion of each calendar year an IRS Form 1099, which shall indicate the total compensation paid by CMEA Bay Section to the Adjudicator.

II. ADJUDICATOR QUALIFICATIONS
In order to adjudicate performances at a music festival held by CMEA Bay Section:
   A. The Adjudicator must maintain a distinct occupation, fully immersed in the music field, as either: a professional musician and/or a well-qualified music teacher.
   B. The Adjudicator must be an active member of the National Association for Music Education (NAfME)
   C. The Adjudicator must execute the CMEA Bay Section Independent Contractor Agreement for Music Festival Adjudication, memorializing his/her agreement to
perform adjudication services for CMEA Bay Section as an independent contractor, as outlined in more detail in Section IV of this document.

D. The Adjudicator must acquire, repair, and maintain the necessary tools for adjudication; a quality digital recorder using a standard SDHC card and four compatible SDHC cards, at the Adjudicator’s sole cost and expense, the same of which may be utilized by the Adjudicator in adjudicating festivals held by other associations.

E. The Adjudicator must be a highly skilled musician, which may be demonstrated in any one of the following ways:

1. By Achieving three or more consecutive years of Superior ratings at CMEA Bay Section large group festivals, and/or;
2. By achieving three or more consecutive years of Superior ratings at CMEA Bay Section solo and ensemble festivals, and/or;
3. By being an active successful professional musician, and;
4. Having successfully completed the initial training program, as outlined in Section III of this document. Proposed Adjudicators must be approved by unanimous vote of the Executive Committee of CMEA Bay Section.

III. TRAINING AND EVALUATION

A. Initial training on CMEA Bay Section Adjudication Guidelines:

1. Apprentice Adjudicators will be assigned by the Adjudication Director to train at one or more festivals, including a minimum of one full day. For large groups this will involve performance, sight-reading and clinic observation and participation. For solo and ensemble events this will involve observation and participation of a specific event.

2. The Apprentice will be supervised by a Mentor Adjudicator who will compare written and verbal comments, give suggestions, and assist the apprentice in developing good adjudication techniques, which can be utilized by the Adjudicator in providing services for CMEA Bay Section as well as other associations.

3. Apprentice training will be required of all new Adjudicators to CMEA Bay Section, regardless of their previous experience. This training is solely to familiarize them with CMEA Bay Section concepts and procedures for festival adjudication.

4. The Apprentice will receive complimentary lunch or dinner.

5. The restriction against adjudicating in one’s own teaching CMEA Bay Section Area does not apply to apprentice training.

6. The Mentor Adjudicator will report to the Adjudication Director his/her evaluation, and recommend either further apprentice experience or acceptance.
as a qualified Adjudicator. This will be done immediately upon completion of the festival in which the training was completed, using the “Adjudication Trainee Performance Evaluation” form, available to download from the CMEA Bay Section website.

7. Upon recommendation of the Adjudication Director, based on the training and evaluation described above, the Apprentice’s name will be proposed to the Executive Committee for approval and addition to the list of active Adjudicators.

B. Additional Training: All active Adjudicators, including Apprentices, must attend an adjudication workshop once every two years at the Winter Conference or at other times or locations announced, for the purpose of keeping Adjudicators informed of advances in the music profession.

C. Evaluation: Adjudicators may be evaluated periodically by CMEA Bay Section, on a rotating basis, to determine whether the Adjudicator is maintaining a positive, informed, and helpful approach, which in turn aids CMEA Bay Section in deciding whether to engage the Adjudicator’s services again for a future season. Evaluation may be by a Mentor or a qualified CMEA Bay Section Board Member.

1. All first-year Adjudicators will be evaluated.

2. All Head Adjudicators will evaluate those Adjudicators assigned to his/her festival, immediately upon completion of that festival, using the “Head Adjudicator’s Festival Report” form available to download from the CMEA Bay Section website.

3. Participating teachers are requested to evaluate Adjudicators at each festival they attend. An interactive form for this purpose may be found among the festival materials electronically provided to each teacher and will be automatically forwarded to the Adjudication Director and from there to the Adjudicator evaluated.

4. Rating summary forms are sent to the Adjudication Director by Site Hosts after each festival. These are needed to help in the evaluation of Adjudicators’ rating standards. These forms are electronically provided to the Site Host among other festival materials.

5. At the conclusion of the festival season, the Adjudication Director will compile all available information, based on evaluations and other communications, and record such information. A report will then be made to the Executive Committee who will review the list of Adjudicators, making changes according to Apprentice training and evaluation results.

6. An Adjudicator may not receive assignments due to: failure to attend workshops as required; repeated non-acceptance and/or cancellation of contracts; disregard of CMEA Bay Section requirements and procedures; and/or failure to respond to communications.
7. An Adjudicator’s name may be deleted from the CMEA Bay Section Adjudicator list due to poor evaluation results.

IV. ADJUDICATOR DUTIES AND RESPONSIBILITIES

A. Engagement of Adjudicator’s services prior to festival season:

1. Early in the school year Adjudicators will be sent for review required documents for contracting with CMEA Bay Section to be an Adjudicator for the upcoming festival season. These forms include a cover letter giving current information and pay scale, an “Adjudicator Profile”, a “Festival Schedule/Availability Form”, and a “Festival Adjudicator Contract”. All required forms shall be completed and returned to the Adjudication Director by the given deadline or it will be assumed that the Adjudicator does not wish to be considered for an adjudication assignment.

2. Adjudicators are engaged for a limited period of time, as Independent Contractors, and paid on an individual contract basis, by assignment, at a rate of pay set each year by CMEA Bay Section Board of Directors. Signing and returning the aforementioned “Music Festival Adjudication Contract” will be effective for all assigned and accepted festivals throughout the upcoming festival season, as outlined in the subject contract. If the assigned Adjudicator is unable or unwilling to fulfill any given assignment, the Adjudication Director must be contacted immediately.

3. Per the “Music Festival Adjudication Contract”, should the Adjudicator not perform his/her adjudication services to the satisfaction of CMEA Bay Section, CMEA Bay Section reserves the right to terminate the subject’s contract.

4. Adjudicators should familiarize themselves with Section III of the CMEA Bay Section Handbook concerning the type of festival and event they are to adjudicate.

B. Adjudicator Assignments

The nature of the relationship between CMEA Bay Section and an Adjudicator is a non-exclusive one. Adjudicators are free to perform the same or similar services outside of CMEA Bay Section, throughout the festival season, and are encouraged to do so by CMEA Bay Section insofar as it makes the individual a stronger adjudicator. Adjudicator agrees to provide his/her dates of availability during the Festival Season to CMEA Bay Section so that CMEA Bay Section may provide any available assignments to Adjudicator for consideration.

1. All assignments will be made via email as outlined below. Adjudicators have full discretion to accept or deny an assignment from CMEA Bay Section for a particular festival and must indicate his or her decision via email within one week of receipt of subject email. Non-response will result in the assignment being given to another Adjudicator, without further notice. Should an
Adjudicator cancel an accepted assignment less than one month prior to the assignment, per the “Music Festival Adjudication Contract”, CMEA Bay Section reserves the right to not consider the Adjudicator for future assignments.

2. Jazz festival contracts will be offered in November of each year.

3. Other large group festival contracts will be offered in December of each year.

4. Solo and ensemble festival contracts will be offered in January of each year after entries are received and specific needs are determined for each festival.

5. Adjudicators are generally not offered contracts to festivals in the CMEA Bay Section Area in which they are music educators.

6. Adjudicators are rotated, as much as possible, throughout the CMEA Bay Section Areas so that performers do not encounter the same Adjudicator again for at least two years.

7. Adjudicators are rotated in sight-reading assignments, which must be accepted.

8. An attempt is made to vary the teaching levels of the Adjudicators at large group festivals.

9. A Head Adjudicator will be assigned to each festival. His/her duties are as outlined in Section V of this document.

10. A Mentor Adjudicator will be assigned to each festival where an Apprentice is assigned. His/her duties are as outlined in Section VI of this document.

C. Adjudicator Role at Festivals

1. Adjudicators will meet at least 30 minutes before the first performance. This meeting is to be conducted by the Head Adjudicator in conjunction with the Area Representative and the Site Host.
   a. The Site Host will go over last-minute information including cancellations, time elements, locations of events, meals, etc.
   b. The Area Representative will represent the CMEA Bay Section Board, giving any pertinent information from that group.
   c. The Head Adjudicator will go over festival procedures, requirements, ratings, and review other information, as needed. At large group festivals the Head Adjudicator will inform the others of the rotation schedule for clinics.

2. Solo and Ensemble Festivals, including Solo Jazz Festivals
   a. One Adjudicator is assigned to each Solo and Ensemble event, and will adjudicate performances of no more than 5 minutes within a 10-minute time schedule. One Adjudicator is assigned to Solo Jazz festivals and will adjudicate performances of no more than 8 minutes within a 15-minute time schedule. The Adjudicator MUST, as time permits, rise and go forward to speak with the student(s) following the performance. The Adjudicator may
award Command Performance cards to those considered to have given a unique or special performance. Care must be taken to not use this subjective recognition as another rating above Superior.

b. The student must present a copy of the solo, or score to the Adjudicator upon entering the performance area. The performer should pick up this music upon exiting the area after the performance. If no score or solo part is provided, the rating MUST be lowered by one grade.

3. Large Group Festivals

a. Each event will have four Adjudicators, three of whom will adjudicate the performance of each ensemble, except as outlined below. The fourth Adjudicator will be the Sight-Reading Adjudicator.

1) For Vocal Jazz there will only be three performance Adjudicators, with no sight-reading involved.

2) For Jazz Combo there will only be two performance Adjudicators, with no sight-reading involved.

b. Adjudicators are to be seated separately and are not to confer during the performances. At the end of the performance, a conference may take place if any of the Adjudicators feel this is necessary or helpful. In no case should such a conference take place within hearing of others, with the exception of the Area Representative or the Site Host.

c. The maximum performance time for each ensemble is outlined below. The time period shall include entry, setup, performance, and exit of the ensemble. An ensemble that exceeds these limits WILL BE STOPPED WITHOUT PENALTY, if they stop immediately when directed to.

1) For Choral ensembles (except Vocal Jazz) 13 minutes is allotted for performance within a 25-minute time period.

2) For Vocal Jazz 15 minutes is allotted for performance within a 30-minute time period, with the balance of the time used for a clinic held in the performance area.

3) For Instrumental ensembles (except Jazz Combo) 17 minutes is allotted for performance within a 30-minute time period.

4) For Jazz Combo 15 minutes is allotted for performance within a 25-minute time period, with the balance of the time used for a clinic held in the performance area.

d. Performance Adjudicators will give recorded comments in addition to completing the appropriate adjudication form.

1) All Adjudicators are required to bring their own digital recorder capable of using standard SDHC cards, and four cards compatible
to their recorder, labeled with their names and numbered 1 through 4.

2) All Adjudicators are required to check the categories on the provided adjudication forms, writing any additional comments desired and completing the finalized score sheet.

e. At the end of the performance each ensemble will be involved in either sight-reading or a clinic, which will be 25 minutes for choral ensembles (15 minutes for Vocal Jazz), and 30 minutes for instrumental ensembles (10 minutes for Jazz Combo). This time may include moving to another area, as well as entry, setup, sight-reading or clinic, the Adjudicator’s concluding comments, and exit.

1) Sight-reading and/or clinic will be recorded.

2) When an Adjudicator goes with an ensemble to give a clinic, the Sight-Reading Adjudicator moves to the performance event.

3) It is strongly preferred that the Sight-Reading Adjudicator not evaluate the same group in both performance and sight-reading.

4) In no case should a clinic be given by an Adjudicator who did not hear the ensemble’s performance.

5) At any given festival all sight-reading shall be administered by the same Adjudicator.

6) If on occasion the schedule requires the Sight-Reading Adjudicator to evaluate a performance and then go with that ensemble to evaluate them in sight-reading, this is allowable. The Head Adjudicator should try to avoid this when making up the rotation schedule, if at all possible.

7) All Adjudicators should be aware of which ensembles they are going to clinic throughout the day.

D. Sight-reading: Band, Orchestra, Choral, and Jazz:
See CMEA Bay Section Handbook Section III for procedures.

E. Solo and Ensemble: See CMEA Bay Section Handbook Section III for procedures.

V. HEAD ADJUDICATOR

A. At each festival, one of the Adjudicators will be assigned the responsibility of Head Adjudicator. This person will be responsible for answering questions concerning requirements and problems which may occur, and for assessing reduction in ratings for failure to abide by procedures as outlined in the CMEA Bay Section Handbook and these Guidelines. It is important that he/she be familiar with the CMEA Bay Section Handbook and these Guidelines and have a copy of each at the festival. At many group festivals, there will be one Adjudicator from outside the Bay Section and/or one first-year Adjudicator. It is essential that the Head Adjudicator be able to answer any and all questions they may have.
B. Responsibilities at Large Group Festivals

1. When the schedule arrives from the Site Host, the Head Adjudicator must make up a preliminary rotation schedule for clinics.
   a. All sight-reading must be done by the same Adjudicator.
   b. It is strongly preferred that the Sight-Reading Adjudicator not evaluate the same ensemble both in performance and sight-reading, if at all possible.
   c. In no case should a clinic be given by an Adjudicator who did not hear the ensemble’s performance.
   d. Directors with multiple ensembles should have different Adjudicators for their clinics, when possible.

2. Arrive at the festival site early enough to check adjudication areas to be used, seating, recording materials and forms, sight-reading music and schedule changes, and making changes in Adjudicator rotation, as necessary. Ensure the festival headquarters staff understands the ratings summary format. Discuss posting of ratings, and the fact that the ratings for an ensemble may not be more than one rating apart. Only letters representing the ratings may be used; never a number and/or a plus or minus (i.e. S,E,G, etc.). UNDER NO CIRCUMSTANCES MAY THE RATINGS BE CHANGED ONCE FINALIZED BY THE HEAD ADJUDICATOR AND POSTED.

3. Assist in keeping the festivals running on time. It is the responsibility of the Head Adjudicator to stop an ensemble’s performance should it exceed the allotted time.

4. Collect and review all Adjudicator Rating forms before turning them into headquarters for posting; resolving any composite ratings involving more than two different rating levels.

5. Complete the “Head Adjudicator Festival Report” and submit it to the Adjudication Director within 24 hours of the festival completion via email. Problems or unique events during the festival should be reported to the Area Representative, who should act as the CMEA Bay Section representative.

VI. MENTOR ADJUDICATORS

Mentor Adjudicators are a select group of experienced Adjudicators who have demonstrated their knowledge of CMEA Bay Section policies and procedures, who are currently active in CMEA Bay Section adjudication, and who have outstanding adjudication skills. Their duties are:

A. Work with Apprentice Adjudicators in a regular festival situation.

   1. In Solo and Ensemble festivals, the Apprentice will observe the Mentor evaluating students and giving them comments for the first half-day, then actually participate during the last half-day, sharing duties with the Mentor.
2. In Large Group festivals, the Apprentice will spend one-half day with the Mentor, making recorded and written comments of performances. The following half-day will be spent doing the same with the Sight-Reading Adjudicator and Clinicians.

B. Only the Mentors' written comments and ratings are to be given to the participant and posted. The Apprentice's comments and ratings are for training purposes only and will not be shared with anyone other than the Mentor.

C. Complete the “Adjudication Trainee Performance Evaluation” form, evaluating the Apprentice’s performance, making recommendations for future adjudication assignments, and submitting the form to the Adjudication Director within 24 hours of the festival completion, via email.

VII. STANDARDS

In evaluating a performance, judgment lies solely with the assigned Adjudicator.

A. The Adjudicator is considered to be a master teacher and a figure of authority in the adjudication process. His/her actions, attitude, and comments must contribute to the improvement and encouragement of the performers.

B. There are no restrictions as to the difficulty level of selections performed. It is recognized that the adjudication will reflect not only the quality of the performance but the quality of the music selected and its suitability to the individual/ensemble.

1. This judgment lies solely with the Adjudicator. In addition to these factors, the Adjudicator must take into consideration the experience, size of the ensemble, number of rehearsal hours per week, etc., as indicated on the provided Adjudication Form. If this information is not provided, the Adjudicator should ask for it from the director or student before the performance begins.

2. In all cases, participants must use art music as opposed to “pop” music. Otherwise they will have their rating lowered by one grade by all performance Adjudicators.

C. When persons accept a contract to adjudicate, they should have wide experience in listening to performers of the level they are to adjudicate. In no other way can they properly form ideas as to the standards of performance they can reasonably expect from students of different levels and backgrounds.

Adjudicators should realize their responsibility for helping to establish and maintain proper standards of performance, but they should not forget the importance of stimulating and lending encouragement, especially to less advanced performers. The mark of a truly outstanding Adjudicator is not how well he/she works with advanced students, but how much help and encouragement he/she gives to students who have not yet attained excellence. An Adjudicator should be a person who sincerely wishes to encourage young musicians by recognizing their
achievement and to improve their performance by pointing out, in a positive manner, how they can strengthen their weaknesses. In short, an Adjudicator should be a teacher. In this way the Adjudicator can maintain and improve the standards of music education in the schools.

VIII. RECOMMENDED PROCEDURES FOR ADJUDICATOR COMMENTS

A. The Adjudicators should first listen to a performance and appraise it in terms of the categories on the Adjudication Form, using the Performance Rubrics. If they are to be helpful as well as critical, they must be specific in their comments, and they must justify and clarify verbal and written comments and/or checkmarks and ratings. They should acquire a vocabulary with which they can record their impressions and suggestions clearly and concisely. This does not mean simply to point out such obvious things as “this instrument played a B-flat instead of a B-natural in the third measure of Z,” but to call attention to fundamental characteristics of the ensemble, i.e., the presence or lack of good tone quality, intonation, precision of execution, phrasing, musicality, etc.

1. Adjudicators are to give constructive and positive criticism through written, recorded and/or verbal comments. The Adjudicator should keep the focus of the comments on the student(s), and convey a sense of sincere encouragement. Comments should not only point out problems, but must include ways to solve the problems.

   a. Verbal comments MUST be consistent with the written comments and the rating awarded.

   b. Check marks and/or scores MUST be consistent with the rating awarded, and MUST be backed up with constructive comments, especially in the case of low ratings.

2. Adjudicators must clarify their ratings through written, recorded, and/or verbal comments in the clinic situation. Participants will be more willing to accept a rating when the Adjudicator points out the conditions which brought about the rating and offers concrete suggestions for improvement. In terms of education value, critical comments are the most important contribution made by the Adjudicator, but in the minds of the participants and often of the directors, the rating is too often the ultimate goal. Failure to make clear the basis for the rating negates the valuable results which are intended.

3. The Adjudicators must be capable of expressing themselves legibly, concisely, and diplomatically. They should avoid writing or making a verbal comment which a director cannot share with either the students or administrators.

4. The Adjudicator must translate what is heard into terms of the categories on the Adjudication Form. Care must be taken to assure that comments are consistent with the scores and/or check marks. A director cannot be blamed for being dissatisfied if comments are generally full of praise while the rating
is low, or if a form is filled with “Outstanding” and “Superior” marks while the comments are generally negative.

5. Adjudicators should set high, yet attainable standards. These standards should not be solely based on performances comparable to those of college-level or professional musicians.

6. Adjudicators will not use electronic devices such as metronomes, tuners, etc., in their adjudication process.

IX. RATINGS STANDARDS

A. The categories to be considered in determining the rating are specified on the Adjudication Form, and it is the responsibility of the Adjudicator to limit assessment to these categories.

B. Persons who listen to many performances of standard works will be aware of the fact that there may be several different interpretations of the same work, each of them valid. An Adjudicator may prefer one over the other, but should not penalize a performance because he/she does not like the interpretation, so long as it is logical and does not violate the rules of style and good taste.

C. The rating system is designed to ensure that a single category does not over-balance the others. The Adjudicator must not lower the overall rating because of a weakness in a single area. Again, the final rating must be consistent with the markings of the individual categories.

D. When hearing groups or soloists of different grade levels, the Adjudicator must remember that it is just as possible for a middle school or elementary school ensemble, or a small ensemble, to receive a high rating as it is for a large ensemble or one from a higher grade level to receive a low rating.

E. An individual or ensemble may receive disqualification or the lowering of a final rating as a result of not following the festival rules and regulations as outlined in the CMEA Bay Section Handbook. The following penalties will be assessed by the Adjudicator(s) for Large Group festivals, and the Event Adjudicator for Solo and Ensemble and Solo Jazz festivals. Assessed penalties are not negotiable.

1. Required lowering of each final rating by one grade by each Adjudicator:
   a. An ensemble being conducted in a Solo and Ensemble festival, with the exception of percussion entries.
   b. More than three on a vocal part in a Solo and Ensemble festival.
   c. More than one on an instrumental part in a Solo and Ensemble festival.
   d. The use of electronic devices not specifically called for in the arrangement.
   e. The use of recorded accompaniment.
   f. The performance of “pop” music in place of art music.
g. Failure to stop performing when directed to by the Head Adjudicator.

h. Failure to provide a score (or solo part in Solo and Ensemble festivals) for each Adjudicator, properly assembled and with measures and cuts clearly numbered. Penalty assessed only by Adjudicator(s) not receiving properly prepared scores. No penalty will be assessed by remaining Adjudicators who have been provided properly prepared scores.

i. Failure in Large Group festivals for a choral ensemble to sing from memory.

j. Performing Choral Sight-Reading with accompaniment in Large Group festivals.

k. Failure of the entire ensemble (as parts are provided and available) to perform. This includes during the Sight-Reading process.

F. An individual or ensemble may perform for “Comments Only.”

G. Multiple-school performing ensembles serving in place of individual school ensembles are acceptable provided they are instructed by the same teacher and have prior approval from CMEA Bay Section Executive Committee.

H. UNDER NO CIRCUMSTANCES MAY THE RATINGS BE CHANGED ONCE FINALIZED BY THE HEAD ADJUDICATOR AND POSTED.

X. AWARDED RATINGS

Ratings are determined and awarded as outlined below.

A. Large Groups: Specific details of festival performance are noted on the “Performance Rubric” for each type of ensemble (Band, Orchestra, Choir, and Jazz).

B. Solo and Ensemble Groups: Specific details of festival performance are noted in Section III of the CMEA Bay Section Handbook.

C. Ratings will not be given at designated non-rated festivals or to ensembles requesting “Comments Only.”

D. Plus and/or minus signs will not be employed in any ratings.

E. Assessed penalties are not negotiable.

F. Under no circumstances will ratings be changed once they are approved by the Head Adjudicator and posted.

G. The following references to final ratings will be applied only to designated rated festivals:

1. SUPERIOR

This rating represents the finest conceivable performance for the event and the level of participants being adjudicated, worthy of being recognized as among the very best. While the Adjudicator might find some minor points to criticize and make some helpful suggestions for further improvement, their comments and/or check
marks would show a preponderance of “Superiors.” Comments would be generally complimentary for outstanding work.

2. EXCELLENT
This rating reflects a fine performance in many respects but not one worthy of the highest rating due to minor defects. It is, however, a performance of distinct quality. This performance usually shows the results of sound, fundamental training, but the performance lacks the polish and artistry necessary to qualify for a “Superior.” There would probably be some “Superior” and perhaps a few “Good” comments and/or check marks, but more comments and/or check marks would be in the “Excellent” area rather than the “Good” or “Fair” areas.

3. GOOD
This rating is awarded for a good performance, but one that is not excellent. The performance shows accomplishments and marked promise, but is lacking in one or more essential qualities. This rating indicates room for improvement in many of the fundamental items listed on the Adjudicators’ comment sheets. Such forms might show one or two marks in the “Superior,” “Excellent” and/or “Good” areas, but would show a majority “Goods” and “Fairs.” There would probably not be time or space to record each separate error as it occurred, but the group would have some basically fine qualities and there should be ample opportunity for the Adjudicator to make suggestions for general improvement of fundamental weaknesses.

4. FAIR
This rating describes a performance that shows some obvious weaknesses. These may reflect handicaps in the way of instruction, instrumentation, or lack of rehearsal time. This rating represents a performance that is generally weak and uncertain. There are numerous errors in most of the fundamental categories. The Adjudicators’ sheets will show a great many areas in need of attention and the Adjudicators will probably not devote much space to pointing out specific errors. Comments should be encouraging and contain helpful suggestions for improvement. They might suggest such things as schedule and rehearsal improvements, or more careful suggestions for ensemble or individual studies and exercises that would contribute to the development of a soloist or group. (Perhaps a private note to the director with suggestions might be in order for this rating.)

5. COMMENTS ONLY (resulting in a Non-Rated Performance)
Soloists and/or groups always have the option of performing at any festival for “Comments Only.” This is an excellent option for a newer program or one that does not meet the criteria for performance as outlined in the CMEA Bay Section Handbook. This applies to Solo and Ensemble as well as Large Group festivals. The individual or group proceeds through the festival performance in the same manner as a rated group. Upon completion of the performance process the director will receive completed adjudication rating forms in his/her packet indicating points
and ratings awarded as all other groups. However, postings on the on-site festival rating board and the Ratings Summary Sheets will read “Comments Only.” No scores will be posted.