

Speech and Theatre Association of Missouri

Officers

President	Richard Herman University of Central Missouri
Vice-President	Wendy Czerwonka West Plains High School
Vice-President Elect	Randy Dillion Missouri State University
Immediate Past-President	Debbie Corbin Branson High School
Executive Secretary	Scott Jensen Webster University
Director of Publications	Gina Jensen Webster University

Board of Governors

Bob Clubbs, Jackson High School	2010
Susan Cooper, Blue Springs South High School	2009
Tom Leith, Moreland Ridge Middle School	2009
Steve Lewis, Three Rivers Community College	2008
Tom Martin, Camdenton High School	2009
Al Nicolai, Cape Girardeau Central High School	2008
Beth Ocheskey, Center High School	2010
Jeff Peltz, University of Central Missouri	2009
Karla Penechar, Raymore-Peculiar High School	2008
Cassie Price-Aguero, Liberty High School	2008
Sarah Gerling, Sedalia Middle School	2010
Tim Wells, State Fair Community College	2010

Historian	Shannon Johnson University of Central Missouri
Student Member for 2006-2007	Jennifer Fugate University of Central Missouri
Director of Electronic Communications	Chris Stephens St. Louis Community College at Florissant Valley

Journal of the Speech and Theatre Association of Missouri

Volume XXXVIII, Fall 2008

Published by the Speech and Theatre Association of Missouri - ISSN 1073-8460

Scholarly Articles

- The Use of Relational Maintenance Behaviors among Emerging Adult Siblings 1
Mary A. Eidsness and Scott A. Myers
- Is Excellence in Student Preparation Getting Better? 16
Tricia L. Hansen-Horn and Terry M. Cunconan
- Confucianism in South Korean Drama 37
Yangyang Sun, Kevin Ellis and Randy K. Dillon
- Defending the Defenseless: Paul Hill's Justification for Killing Abortion Doctors 45
David L. Sutton
- Exploring the Use of Media and Technology by Religious Institutions 73
Shonna L. Tropf, Ph.D.

Teaching Resources

- Pop Quiz/Shmop Quiz: Innovative Approaches to Assessing Students' Understanding 97
Laurie Melnik

Journal of the Speech and Theatre Association of Missouri

Volume 38, Fall 2008

Editor

**Gina Jensen
Webster University**

Editor's Assistant

**Leigh Cummings
Webster University**

Referees and Editorial Board

Dr. Sandra Alspaugh
Ferris State University

Dr. Michael Bartanen
Pacific Lutheran University

Scott Jensen
Webster University

Ryan Louis
Ottawa University

Patrick Luster
McNeese State University

Robert Markstrom
McNeese State University

Dr. Susan Milsap
Otterbein College

Dr. Phillip Voight
Gustavus Adolphus College

Policy Statement and Call for Papers
Journal of the Speech and Theatre Association of Missouri
Fall 2009 – Volume 39

The editor of the 2008 *Journal of the Speech and Theatre Association of Missouri* is presently accepting manuscripts. Scholarly articles, book and resource reviews, and teaching resources are all encouraged. Scholarship from a diversity of areas from the discipline encompassing communication, speech, and theatre will be considered. These areas include, but are not limited to: Speech, Debate, Theatre Instruction and Performance, Communication Theory, Interpersonal Communication, Intercultural Communication, Health Communication, Rhetoric, Persuasion, Organizational Communication, Political Communication, Family Communications, Listening, Communication Ethics, Mediation, Public Relations, Film, Mass Media Theory, Mediated Communication, and New Communication Technologies.

All submissions should be in Microsoft Word. References should follow the latest edition of the American Psychological Association style manual. Three paper copies and a diskette copy should be included with each submission. Submissions will also be accepted via electronic communication and should be directed to jensen@webster.edu. Author affiliation and an abstract should be included as a separate document or page. All submissions should be received by February 9, 2009, to insure full consideration for publication.

Updated submission information for volume 39 will be available in October of 2008 at the website for the Speech and Theatre Association of Missouri – www.stamnet.org

Submissions can be sent to:

Gina L. Jensen, Editor

Journal of the Speech and Theatre Association of Missouri

Department of Communication & Journalism

Webster University

470 E. Lockwood Ave.

St. Louis, MO 63119

(314) 968-7164

jensen@webster.edu

The Use of Relational Maintenance Behaviors among Emerging Adult Siblings

Mary A. Eidsness and Scott A. Myers

Abstract

This study examined the relational maintenance behaviors used by emerging adults to maintain their sibling relationships. Participants were 153 undergraduate students at a large Mid-Atlantic university. Results indicate that (a) emerging adults use (in descending order) the tasks, positivity, networks, assurances, and openness relational maintenance behaviors with their siblings; (b) perceived sibling solidarity is associated positively with all five relational maintenance behaviors; and (c) assurances is a significant predictor of perceived sibling solidarity. Future research should identify the channels (e.g., telephone, mail, e-mail, visits) emerging adult siblings use in conjunction with their use of relational maintenance behaviors.

For many individuals, the transition from adolescence to adulthood is a period characterized by change and exploration where little exists that is normative (Arnett, 2000). Termed emerging adulthood, this period generally occurs between the age of 18 to 25 years and is considered to be a period of ambivalence in which young adults no longer consider themselves to be adolescents, but at the same time do not consider themselves to have reached adulthood (Arnett, 1998). This period is marked by an increased assertion of independence; a focus on individualistic—rather than other-oriented goals; a lack of responsibility to and commitment associated with work, educational, and relational endeavors; and an increased use of risk-taking behaviors involving sex, drugs, and alcohol (Arnett, 2000; Nelson & Barry, 2005).

In an attempt to establish their interdependence, emerging adults distance themselves affectively, behaviorally, and

cognitively from their parents and their siblings (Arnett & Taber, 1994; Scharf, Shulman, & Avigad-Spitz, 2005). According to Arnett (1997), emerging adults' attempts to distance themselves from their parents is neither unexpected nor surprising because societal, cultural, and legal norms sanction this attempt. Emerging adults' attempts to distance themselves from their siblings, however, result in two changes that affect the tenor of their sibling relationships. The first change is that not only do emerging adults place a greater priority on their friendships and their romantic relationships than their sibling relationships (Arnett, 2001), but they interact and spend more time with their friends than with their siblings (Pulakos, 1989). The second change is that emerging adults report that their sibling relationships are warmer and less conflictual. Not only do they perceive these relationships as more positive than negative (unlike adolescents), but they consider their siblings to be a source of intimacy despite their increased dependence on their peer relationships (Scharf et al., 2005).

Given these changes in the sibling relationship during emerging adulthood, we were interested in examining the relational maintenance behaviors used by emerging adults to maintain their sibling relationships. Relational maintenance behaviors refer to the actions and activities in which individuals engage to sustain relational definitions (Canary & Stafford, 1994) and consist of positivity, openness, assurances, networks, and tasks (Stafford & Canary, 1991). *Positivity* includes communication behaviors that convey helpful, upbeat, and optimistic thoughts and feelings to the partner; *openness* involves speaking directly with the partner regarding the relationship itself; *assurances* are those messages which indicate a future for the relationship; *networks* are the groups of friends and relatives that are common to both partners in the relationship; and *tasks* consist of the chores and duties each partner is expected to complete specifically for and within the relationship (Canary & Stafford, 1992).

Although the study of relational maintenance behaviors has centered largely on romantic relationships (Stafford & Canary,

2006), researchers have found that relational maintenance behaviors are used in the family (Myers & Glover, 2007; Serewicz, Dickson, Morrison, & Poole, 2007; Thomas-Maddox, 1999; Vogl-Bauer, Kalbfleisch, & Beatty, 1999). In regard to the sibling relationship, Myers and Members of COM 200 (2001) found that adult siblings (i.e., 18 to 91 years) report using (in descending order) the tasks, positivity, assurances, networks, and openness relational maintenance behaviors. In another study of adult siblings (i.e., 26 to 54 years), Myers, Brann, and Rittenour (2008) obtained similar findings (i.e., in descending order, siblings reported using the tasks, assurances, positivity, networks, and openness relational maintenance behaviors). To extend the body of research conducted on adult siblings' use of relational maintenance behaviors by identifying specifically the relational maintenance behaviors emerging adults use with their siblings, the following research question is posed:

RQ1: To what extent do emerging adults report using relational maintenance behaviors (i.e., positivity, openness, assurances, networks, tasks) with their siblings?

Moreover, adult siblings' use of relational maintenance behaviors is associated positively with a host of relational characteristics, including relational closeness, relational satisfaction, commitment, trust, and liking (Mikkelsen, 2006b; Myers & Members of COM 200, 2001; Myers & Weber, 2004). One relational characteristic which has yet to be examined is solidarity. Solidarity, which is considered to be the degree of closeness between two individuals that manifests it in psychological, social, and physical forms (Wheless, 1978) and encompasses the characteristics of attitudinal similarity, physical attraction, extroversion, moderate composure, perceived reciprocity of disclosure, liking, and loving (Wheless, 1976), is considered to be an integral component of the sibling relationship (Allan, 1977). Sibling solidarity is linked positively with the frequency, breadth, and depth of sibling interaction (Rocca &

Martin, 1998) and is the primary predictor of sibling communication satisfaction (Myers, 1998), which may explain why some adults consider at least one sibling to be a best friend (White & Riedmann, 1992). Based on these collective findings, it is likely a positive relationship exists between emerging adult siblings' use of relational maintenance behaviors and sibling solidarity. At the same time, the extent to which relational maintenance behaviors predict sibling solidarity is unknown. To explore these notions, the following hypothesis is posited and the following research question is posed:

H: Among emerging adults, perceived sibling solidarity will be associated positively with their use of relational maintenance behaviors.

RQ2: Among emerging adults, which relational maintenance behaviors predict sibling solidarity?

Method

Participants

Participants were 153 undergraduate students (71 males, 82 females) whose ages ranged from 18 to 25 years ($M = 19.95$, $SD = 1.72$) enrolled in communication courses at a large Mid-Atlantic university. The participants reported on 74 male and 79 female siblings, with the age of the targeted sibling ranging from 12 to 43 years ($M = 20.83$, $SD = 5.60$). The majority of participants ($n = 130$, or 85%) did not reside with the identified sibling. Participants varied in their frequency of communication with their sibling, which ranged from at least once every day ($n = 31$) to several times a week ($n = 50$), several times a month ($n = 48$), several times every 2-3 months ($n = 20$), at least twice a year ($n = 3$), or at least once a year ($n = 1$).

Procedures and Instrumentation

Participants completed two instruments in addition to providing the demographic data profiled above. These instruments were the Relational Maintenance Strategy scale (Canary & Stafford, 1992) and the Interpersonal Solidarity scale (Wheeless, 1978). Following the procedures utilized by Mikkelson (2006b), participants completed the instruments in reference to the sibling whose birthday was closest to theirs within the calendar year. Responses for all instrument items were solicited using a seven-point Likert scale ranging from *strongly agree* (7) to *strongly disagree* (1).

The *Relational Maintenance Strategy scale* is a 29-item scale that asks respondents to indicate the degree to which they use each of five relational maintenance behaviors (i.e., positivity, openness, assurances, networks, sharing tasks) with a romantic partner. Myers and Members of COM 200 (2001) modified the scale by revising the 29 items to reflect the sibling relationship and reported reliability coefficients ranging from .77 to .91 for the five behaviors. Using modified versions completed by adult siblings, Mikkelson (2006b) and Serewicz et al. (2007) obtained reliability coefficients ranging from .74 to .91 for the five behaviors. In this study, reliability coefficients ranged from .82 to .93 (tasks: $M = 5.36$, $SD = 1.07$, $\alpha = .83$; positivity: $M = 5.19$, $SD = 1.12$, $\alpha = .93$; networks: $M = 5.14$, $SD = 1.20$, $\alpha = .82$; assurances: $M = 4.90$, $SD = 1.41$, $\alpha = .86$; openness: $M = 4.14$, $SD = 1.26$, $\alpha = .87$).

The *Interpersonal Solidarity Scale* is a 20-item instrument that asks participants to indicate the degree of closeness they experience with a specific person. In this study, participants were asked to indicate the degree of closeness they experienced with the identified sibling. Previous reliability coefficients ranging from .93 to .96 have been obtained for the scale (Myers, 1998; Myers & Johnson, 2002; Weber & Patterson, 1996). In this study, a coefficient alpha of .95 was obtained ($M = 5.01$, $SD = 1.18$).

Results

The first research question inquired about the extent to which emerging adults report using relational maintenance behaviors (i.e., positivity, openness, assurances, networks, tasks) with their siblings. Based on the mean score of each behavior, it was found that emerging adults used (in descending order) the tasks, positivity, networks, assurances, and openness relational maintenance behaviors with their siblings. A series of t-tests revealed four significant differences in usage among the five relational maintenance behaviors. First, tasks was used more frequently than positivity, $t(152) = 3.41, p < .001$; networks, $t(152) = 3.25, p < .001$; assurances, $t(152) = 6.29, p < .001$; and openness, $t(152) = 14.57, p < .001$. Second, positivity was used more frequently than assurances, $t(152) = 4.64, p < .001$, and openness, $t(152) = 14.51, p < .001$. Third, networks was used more frequently than assurances, $t(152) = 3.52, p < .001$, and openness, $t(152) = 12.01, p < .001$. Fourth, assurances was used more frequently than openness, $t(152) = 11.32, p < .001$. Positivity was not found to be used significantly more often than networks, $t(152) = .80, p = .43$.

The hypothesis predicted that among emerging adults, perceived sibling solidarity would be associated positively with their use of relational maintenance behaviors. The hypothesis was supported. Perceived sibling solidarity was associated positively with assurances ($r = .74, p < .001$), positivity ($r = .65, p < .001$), openness ($r = .65, p < .001$), networks ($r = .65, p < .001$), and tasks ($r = .60, p < .001$).

The second research question inquired about which relational maintenance behaviors predict sibling solidarity among emerging adults. Results of a hierarchical regression analysis revealed a significant model, $R^2 = .57, F(10, 142) = 19.90, p < .001$. Because sibling sex and age are known to influence emerging adults' perceptions of their sibling relationships (Milevsky, Smoot, Leh, & Ruppe, 2005), participant sex,

participant age, sibling sex, sibling sex, and place of residence (i.e., with sibling, not with sibling) were entered as the first block. This first block of variables did not predict sibling solidarity, $R^2 = .02$, $F(5, 147) = .58$, $p > .70$. The second block entered contained the five relational maintenance behaviors. Of the five relational maintenance behaviors, assurances was the only relational maintenance behavior ($\beta = .49$, $p < .001$) that significantly predicted sibling solidarity, $\Delta R^2 = .55$, $\Delta F(5, 142) = 36.90$, $p < .001$.

Discussion

In this study, two general findings emerged. The first finding was that emerging adult siblings reported using the tasks relational maintenance behavior the most frequently and the openness relational maintenance behavior the least frequently. Similar to the results obtained in previous studies using adult sibling samples (Myers et al., 2008; Myers & Members of COM 200, 2001), this finding suggests that across the lifespan, particular relational maintenance behaviors (i.e., tasks) may be more salient than other relational maintenance behaviors (i.e., openness). For emerging adult siblings, tasks may be the most frequently used relational maintenance behavior for many reasons: siblings may participate in a common activity or share the same hobbies or interests; they may provide each other with instrumental support; they may be forced by their parents to participate in family activities, complete family chores, or serve as companions; or as Myers and Members of COM 200 (2001) posited, siblings may consider staying in touch with one another as a task. Given that the majority of the participants in this study reported that they do not live with their siblings, emerging adult siblings may use the tasks relational maintenance behavior as one way to remain involved in each other's lives. Myers and Bryant (2008) found that one way in which emerging adults express their commitment to their siblings is through shared activities, engaging in everyday contact, and providing each other with tangible support--all behaviors which

could be considered a task, given the geographic distance that separates many emerging adult siblings. What has yet to be examined are the channels emerging adults use to maintain their sibling relationships, particularly when it comes to tasks. Future research should identify the channels (e.g., telephone, mail, e-mail, visits) emerging adult siblings use in conjunction with their use of relational maintenance behaviors. Doing so would provide a more comprehensive picture of how siblings, particularly emerging adults, use relational maintenance behaviors.

At the same time, openness was identified as being the least frequently used relational maintenance behavior. This finding can best be explained by the notion that openness is not as vital to the sustenance of the sibling relationship as it is in other (i.e., romantic, platonic) relationships. Unlike romantic or platonic relationships which rely on self-disclosure, affectionate communication, and expressions of intimacy to sustain growth and development, the sibling relationship does not due to its involuntary nature, longevity, and enforced interactions (Mikkelson, 2006a; Newman, 1994). Rather, siblings develop an intimate working knowledge of each other based on shared living space and daily contact during childhood and adolescence. During emerging adulthood, then, siblings do not need to rely on openness as a relational maintenance behavior because not only are they already familiar with each other, but they also do not need to engage in openness to guarantee that their relationship will be sustained.

The second finding was that although perceived sibling solidarity was related positively to siblings' use of all five relational maintenance behaviors, assurances was the only relational maintenance behavior identified as a predictor of solidarity. The positive relationship obtained between perceived sibling solidarity and siblings' use of the five relational maintenance behaviors makes sense: when siblings are emotionally and psychologically close to each other, they use behaviors to keep their relationship in a satisfactory state. Paralleling the research

which has established a positive link between perceived commitment, trust, relational satisfaction, and liking in both sibling (Mikkelsen, 2006b; Myers & Members of COM 200, 2001; Myers & Weber, 2004) and romantic (Canary & Stafford, 1992; Dainton, Stafford, & Canary, 1994; Stafford & Canary, 1991) relationships, this finding reveals that solidarity may be yet another relational characteristic with which relational maintenance behaviors are associated.

Interestingly, assurances was the only relational maintenance behavior that emerged as a significant predictor of sibling solidarity. For emerging adult siblings, stressing their continuation in the relationship may be the best way to express solidarity due to their fluctuating presence in their siblings' lives. Unlike childhood and adolescence where siblings share a living space and have daily contact, emerging adults move out of (and possibly back into) their parents' home and experience a host of competing demands on their time, which include employment, enrollment in post-secondary studies, and relationships with friends and romantic partners. At the same time, it is during emerging adulthood where the sibling relationship adopts a warmer, less conflictual tone (Milevsky, Smoot, Leh, & Ruppe, 2005). This decrease in time spent together, combined with the positive change in the affective tone of the relationship, may make emerging adults realize that if they want to experience closeness (or even remain close) with their siblings, they must indicate their desire to remain involved in, and committed to, the relationship, which they do through their use of the assurances relational maintenance behavior.

There are, however, several limitations to this study which may prevent further generalizations from being reached about emerging adults and their siblings. First, this sample consisted of a heavy concentration (82%) of participants in the lower half of the 18-25 year range. For a more comprehensive view of emerging adults, it may be necessary to gather additional input from older participants who have spent more time apart from their siblings

and families. Moreover, because participants were instructed to complete the measures in regard to the sibling whose birthday is closest to their own, the extent to which emerging adult siblings use relational maintenance behaviors with multiple siblings, as well as the link between relational maintenance behaviors usage and perceived solidarity, is unknown. Future researchers may want to consider investigating further the presence of solidarity among multiple siblings, especially in regard to differences in sibling age and sex, and how solidarity affects their use of relational maintenance behaviors with each sibling.

Additionally, future research should consider exploring siblings' use of relational maintenance behaviors and feelings of solidarity longitudinally. By assessing solidarity throughout the sibling lifespan, researchers could determine if changes in solidarity are related to the frequency or choice of relational maintenance behaviors. Longitudinal studies also would assist researchers in identifying the factors that impact sibling use of relational maintenance behaviors, such as growth (e.g., marriage, children) or loss (e.g., death, divorce) within the family unit. Another consideration for future research would be to extend the research conducted by Myers and Glover (2007) by assessing the use of relational maintenance behaviors between adult children, their parents, and their grandparents.

In sum, the findings obtained in this study indicate that not only do emerging adults use relational maintenance behaviors with their siblings, but that these relational maintenance behaviors are related directly to perceived sibling solidarity. Because emerging adulthood is a time period characterized by participants' lack of commitment to their relationships and vocational endeavors (Arnett, 2000), the sibling relationship may be one of the few stable and meaningful relationships in the lives of emerging adults. As such, emerging adults may be motivated to maintain their sibling relationships as a way that still allows them to remain involved with their families, but in a manner which is congruent with their developing independence, self-sufficiency, and maturity.

References

- Allan, G. (1977). Sibling solidarity. *Journal of Marriage and the Family*, 39, 177-184.
- Arnett, J. J. (1997). Young people's conceptions of the transition to adulthood. *Youth & Society*, 29, 3-23.
- Arnett, J. J. (1998). Learning to stand alone: The contemporary American transition to adulthood in cultural and historical context. *Human Development*, 41, 295-315.
- Arnett, J. J. (2000). Emerging adulthood: A theory of development from the late teens through the twenties. *American Psychologist*, 55, 469-480.
- Arnett, J. J. (2001). Conceptions of the transition to adulthood: Perspective from adolescence through midlife. *Journal of Adult Development*, 8, 133-143.
- Arnett, J. J., & Taber, S. (1994). Adolescence terminable and interminable: When does adolescence end? *Journal of Youth and Adolescence*, 23, 517-537.
- Canary, D. J., & Stafford, L. (1992). Relational maintenance strategies and equity in marriage. *Communication Monographs*, 59, 244-267.
- Canary, D. J., & Stafford, L. (1994). Maintaining relationships through strategic and routine interactions. In D. J. Canary & L. Stafford (Eds.), *Communication and relational maintenance* (pp. 1-22). New York: Academic Press.

- Dainton, M., Stafford, L., & Canary, D. J. (1994). Maintenance strategies and physical affection as predictors of love, liking, and satisfaction in marriage. *Communication Reports*, 7, 88-98.
- Mikkelson, A. C. (2006a). Communication among peers: Adult sibling relationships. In K. Floyd & M. T. Morman (Eds.), *Widening the family circle: New research on family communication* (pp. 21-35). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Mikkelson, A. C. (2006b). *Relational maintenance behaviors, relational outcomes, and sex differences in adult sibling relationships*. Paper presented at the annual meeting of the National Communication Association, San Antonio, TX.
- Milevsky, A., Smoot, K., Leh, M., & Ruppe, A. (2005). Familial and contextual variables and the nature of sibling relationships in emerging adulthood. *Marriage & Family Review*, 37, 123-141.
- Myers, S. A. (1998). Sibling communication satisfaction as a function of interpersonal solidarity, individualized trust, and self-disclosure. *Communication Research Reports*, 15, 309-317.
- Myers, S. A., Brann, M., & Rittenour, C. E. (2008). Interpersonal communication motives as a predictor of early and middle adulthood siblings' use of relational maintenance behaviors. *Communication Research Reports*, 25, 155-167.
- Myers, S. A., & Bryant, L. E. (2008). The use of behavioral indicators of sibling commitment among emerging adults. *Journal of Family Communication*, 8, 101-125.

- Myers, S. A., & Glover, N. P. (2007). Emerging adults' use of relational maintenance behaviors with their parents. *Communication Research Reports, 24*, 257-264.
- Myers, S. A., & Johnson, A. D. (2002). Scores on liking and solidarity in interpersonal relationships. *Psychological Reports, 91*, 855-856.
- Myers, S. A., & Members of COM 200. (2001). Relational maintenance behaviors in the sibling relationship. *Communication Quarterly, 49*, 19-34.
- Myers, S. A., & Weber, K. D. (2004). Preliminary development of a measure of sibling relational maintenance behaviors: Scale development and initial findings. *Communication Quarterly, 52*, 334-346.
- Nelson, L. J., & Barry, C. M. (2005). Distinguishing features of emerging adulthood: The role of self-classification as an adult. *Journal of Adolescent Research, 20*, 242-262.
- Newman, J. (1994). Conflict and friendship in sibling relationships: A review. *Child Study Journal, 24*, 119-154.
- Pulakos, J. (1989). Young adult relationships: Siblings and friends. *Journal of Psychology, 123*, 237-244.
- Rocca, K. A., & Martin, M. M. (1998). The relationship between willingness to communicate and solidarity with frequency, breadth, and depth of communication in the sibling relationship. *Communication Research Reports, 15*, 82-90.
- Scharf, M., Shulman, S., & Avigad-Spitz, L. (2005). Sibling relationships in emerging adulthood and in adolescence. *Journal of Adolescent Research, 20*, 64-90.

- Serewicz, M. C. M., Dickson, F. C., Morrison, J. H. T. A., & Poole, L. L. (2007). Family privacy orientation, relational maintenance, and family satisfaction in young adults' family relationships. *Journal of Family Communication, 7*, 123-142.
- Stafford, L., & Canary, D. J. (1991). Maintenance strategies and romantic relationship type, gender and relational characteristics. *Journal of Social and Personal Relationships, 8*, 217-242.
- Stafford, L., & Canary, D. J. (2006). Equity and interdependence as predictors of relational maintenance strategies. *Journal of Family Communication, 6*, 227-254.
- Thomas-Maddox, C. (1999, November). *Keeping the relationship alive: An analysis of relational maintenance strategies employed by non-custodial parents and their children following divorce*. Paper presented at the annual meeting of the National Communication Association, Chicago, IL.
- Vogl-Bauer, S., Kalbfleisch, P. J., & Beatty, M. (1999). Perceived equity, satisfaction, and relational maintenance strategies in parent-adolescent dyads. *Journal of Youth and Adolescence, 28*, 27-49.
- Weber, K. D., & Patterson, B. R. (1996). Construction and validation of a communication based emotional scale. *Communication Research Reports, 13*, 68-76.
- Wheeless, L. R. (1976). Self-disclosure and interpersonal solidarity: Measurement, validation, and relationships. *Human Communication Research, 3*, 47-61.

Wheless, L. R. (1978). A follow-up study of the relationships among trust, disclosure, and interpersonal solidarity. *Human Communication Research*, 4, 143-157.

White, L. K., & Riedmann, A. (1992). Ties among adult siblings. *Social Forces*, 71, 85-102.

Mary A. Eidsness (M.A., West Virginia University, 2007) is employed in private industry. Scott A. Myers (Ph.D., Kent State University, 1995) is an Associate Professor in the Department of Communication Studies, P.O. Box 6293, 108 Armstrong Hall, West Virginia University, Morgantown, WV 26506-6293, (304) 293-3905 office, (304) 293-8667 fax, smyers@mail.wvu.edu. Address all correspondence to the second author.

**IS EXCELLENCE IN STUDENT PREPARATION GETTING
EASIER? INVESTIGATING RECOMMENDED
CONVERGENCE BETWEEN PUBLIC RELATIONS AND
ORGANIZATIONAL COMMUNICATION**

Tricia L. Hansen-Horn and Terry M. Cunconan

Abstract

Educators are always interested in how to best prepare their students for professional pursuits. This study examines similarities and differences among competencies in public relations and organizational communication. Using recommended categories for study provided by the 2006 Report of the Commission on Public Relations Education, the authors undertake a content analysis of the top three undergraduate textbooks in public relations and organizational communication. The goal is to determine how these areas may complement each other in reaching the educational goals set forth in the Commission's report. The analysis demonstrates that competencies in public relations and organizational communication are not mutually exclusive and requiring the introduction to organizational communication course of all public relations majors students is a recommendable course of action.

Of particular interest to many of us in academic settings is how to best prepare college students for entrance into the world of professional communication, especially when it comes to public relations. Public relations programs continue to develop and grow at impressive rates, therefore, best practices in preparation are increasingly important.

As a means of excellence in student preparation, Cunconan and Hansen-Horn (2001) stressed the need to redress traditional assumptions of difference between public relations and

organizational communication. They suggested that the two areas are quite complimentary and, in fact, when students are exposed to courses in both curriculums their competencies in public relations are sharpened. The current analysis continues this discussion. It provides a comparative review of areas of professional communication covered in major undergraduate public relations and organizational communication textbooks.

Literature Review

It is quite clear that students of public relations benefit when traditional divisions between public relations and organizational communication are redressed and convergence is arranged. The authors of the 1999 Report of the Commission on Public Relations Education¹ clearly endorsed an interdisciplinary approach to public relations education, citing organizational communication as an appropriate supporting discipline to public relations. The argument is no less strong in the 2006 Report of the Commission on Public Relations Education². The authors conclude “while the fundamental knowledge and skills recommended by the 2006 Commission have not changed since 1999, there is a need for refocusing and realignment in terms of what is most heavily emphasized in an undergraduate public relations curriculum” (p. 43). The authors argue that public relations must be particularly broad in the liberal arts and sciences (p. 43) while noting that “the ability to incorporate the internal audience into public relations planning and communication is increasingly required in meeting the challenges and opportunities presented to an organization” (p. 45) demanding that “human resource departments increasingly are expecting public relations to manage employee communication, a change from the days when human resources considered communicating internally to be its exclusive purview” (p. 45). Cunconan and Hansen-Horn (2001) called for including the introductory organizational communication course in the curriculum for all public relations majors. The need

to do so has only been heightened in light of the 2006 Commission's findings.

Zorn (2002) clearly articulated this need when arguing for "overcoming disciplinary fragmentation in business communication, organizational communication, and public relations" (p. 44). He argued for a restructuring of programs so curriculum would cross "disciplinary and departmental boundaries" allowing students to "acquire a comprehensive set of communication competencies" (p. 51).

Additionally, Miller and Kernisky (1999) made an earlier call for acquainting public relations students with "principles of organizational communication" such as "organizational discourse, internal/external audiences, organizational culture and hierarchies, and group interaction" (p. 87). Springston and Keyton (2001), Cheney and Christensen (2001a, 2001b), Kazoleas and Wright (2001), have all variously argued that the fields of public relations and organizational communication need to work more closely together.

Cheney and Christensen (2001a) lamented traditional structures of divergence between the two fields. Traditional stances of differences held "by public relations and organizational communication scholars have obstructed the potentially valuable sharing of ideas and the building of joint projects" (p. 171). They further argued (2001b) that "public relations and issue management, therefore, should be regarded in close connection with other forms of organizational communication" (p. 232).

One way to bring about convergence between public relations and organizational communication is to require that public relations students complete an introductory public relations course and an introductory organizational communication course. Cunconan and Hansen-Horn (2001) provided an analysis of how the content covered in these two courses is likely to provide much of the basic knowledge called for by the 1999 Commission on Public Relations Education. Taking the Commission's 12 recommended knowledge categories (see Table 1) as units of

analyses, and assigning the categories equal weight, the Tables of Contents subheadings of the top three public relations and organizational communication textbooks were content analyzed³ for evidence of the knowledge categories. The results provided interesting insights into what knowledge categories students would be exposed to when taking both an introduction to public relations course and an introduction to organizational communication course.

The public relations texts and the organizational communication texts, together, more than adequately addressed communication and persuasion concepts and strategies including mass media, organizational, small group and interpersonal channels of communication. The public relations texts addressed communication and persuasion concepts with an emphasis on mass media channels and strategies. In a complementary fashion, the organizational communication texts emphasized organizational, small group, and interpersonal channels and strategies.

There were three apparent knowledge areas in which the organizational communication texts could easily supplement the content found in the public relations texts: organizational change and development, management concepts and theories, and relationships and relationships building. To a lesser degree, the organizational communication texts' treatment of all the other knowledge categories except marketing and finance and public relations history could be seen as facilitating some knowledge acquisition in desired areas. (p. 7)

Cunconan & Hansen-Horn's analysis clearly demonstrated that "competencies in public relations and organizational communication are not mutually exclusive" (p. 8). Some level of similarity will only reinforce student learning. And, the areas

covered in the organizational communication textbooks and not by the public relations textbooks provided needed knowledge category coverage.

The present study continues the examination of the same six, yet recently revised, undergraduate public relations and organizational communication textbooks. Our intent is to survey differences in exposure to the 1999 Commission's recommended knowledge categories that may exist in the revised textbooks.

Method

The top three introductory textbooks in public relations and organizational communication⁴ were selected for analysis because our goal was to address textual means through which students are familiarized with their disciplines. Introductory textbooks are written to impart foundational knowledge to those who explore them. The Commission argued in its 1999 report that all public relations students need to acquire knowledge in 12 key areas (see Table 1). The 2006 report included the initial 12 categories, of which two have been edited, and an additional two new categories (see Table 2). The two edits simply removed explanatory language attached to the categories "communication persuasion concept and strategies" and "communication and public relations theory." The two added categories were "the business case for diversity" and "various world social, political, economic and historical frameworks." The 12 initial categories have not changed in meaning. The current study simply included the two additions creating 14 categories of interest. Because the Commission did not provide the list of knowledge areas in any significant order, equitable value was assigned to each one. Public relations students need certain forms of knowledge; they begin that acquisition in their introductory courses.

Content analysis of tables of contents was used to explore what forms of desired knowledge students could acquire through their introductory public relations textbooks and what forms of

knowledge were not addressed by these textbooks. The analysis then turned to a complementary communication area, organizational communication, and its introductory textbooks and explored what areas of desired knowledge could be acquired through their content and what knowledge areas were not addressed. The introductory organizational communication material was examined for how it might complement the introductory public relations material in meeting the demands for knowledge set forth by the Commission. Finally, the present analysis was compared to the 2001 analysis, providing a description of trends toward knowledge category acquisition.

Procedure

The three introductory public relations textbooks used in our analysis were those by Cutlip, Center and Broom (2006); Newsom, Turk and Kruckeberg (2007); and Wilcox, Cameron, Ault, and Agee (2006). The three introductory organizational communication textbooks used were Papa, Daniels and Spiker (2008); Eisenberg, Goodall and Trethewey (2007); and Miller (2006). These were the most current editions of the texts, at the time of this study, corresponding to the same used in the 2001 analysis.

The tables of contents from the three selected textbooks in each introductory course were content analyzed by chapter subheading. Subheadings were chosen because they typically represent content-specific knowledge and are more descriptive than chapter titles. Additionally, the researchers had experience and familiarity with the content/use of the texts in teaching the introductory courses. Those subheadings, however, referring to case studies and problems, suggested readings, spotlights on scholarship, etc. were excluded from analysis because they were application driven not content driven. It is important to note that the Eisenberg, Goodall and Trethewey organizational communication textbook regularly used “What Would You Do?” boxes, (similar to those appearing in the 2001 edition, and in

earlier editions of the book known as “Focus on Ethics” boxes). Because ethics is a knowledge category recommended by the Commission, these “boxes” were initially attractive material for analysis. However, because this study looked only at subheadings, and these boxes were labeled as sub-subheadings, they were not included in this analysis. If they had been included, it is possible that the organizational communication texts would have been found to contain a heavier emphasis on ethics than was coded.

Subheadings were coded and categorized based upon the 14 knowledge areas identified in the 2006 Commission’s report. Two of the knowledge areas, public relations history, and legal requirements and issues were deemed to be straightforward and needed no further operationalization. The remaining 12 categories were operationalized as follows: (1) communication and persuasion concepts and strategies as subheadings of written, spoken, and visual forms of interaction that address elements of the basic communication model including the sender, receiver, message, channel, and feedback; (2) communication and public relations theory as subheadings that offer explanation, prediction, and control for communication phenomena in various contexts; (3) relationships and relationship building as subheadings identifying the building and maintaining of transactional relationships at the dyadic, group, organizational, and public levels; (4) societal trends as subheadings reflecting the current status of professional roles, functions, and communication applications including managerial trends; (5) ethical issues as subheadings of ethical codes and ethics in practice; (6) marketing and finance as subheadings identifying the marketing/selling of products and the management of financial resources; (7) uses of research and forecasting as subheadings identifying research techniques and the measurement and evaluation of communicated messages; (8) multicultural and global issues as subheadings centered around diversity and technological changes and innovations; (9) the business case for diversity as subheadings focusing on human resources and vendor functions; (10) various world social, political, economic and historical

frameworks as subheadings centered around historical westernized and non-westernized frames of reference; (11) organizational change and development as subheadings focused on the development of an organization's structure and its members from past to present; and (12) management concepts and theories as subheadings focused on explaining and understanding the elements, principles, and styles for managing resources.

Because the subheadings were not mutually exclusive content categories within the texts, they were labeled with more than one of the 14 knowledge areas. When subheadings were not easily identifiable for coding, the appropriate textbook was referenced for content clarification. Content percentages were calculated using an "N" representative of the total number of knowledge areas addressed by the subheadings and coded accordingly. One subheading could be counted more than one time in the total assessed to N. No adjustments were made for the number of words or paragraphs addressing a certain category; all content coded was assessed equal value. Care was taken to re-establish coding reliability across the texts' subheadings coded in the 2001 study which was then assumed to transfer to the coding in the present study. Both authors served as coders with an intercoder reliability of 80 percent. Those subheadings coded differently were discussed and agreement was reached on coding clarification.

Results

With a total N of 501 from the undergraduate public relations textbooks, the analysis of the subheadings identified the largest amount or 20% of the subheadings as communication and persuasion concepts and strategies (see Table 3). Management concepts were identified in 13% of the subheadings, followed by relationships and relationship building at 12%. Various world social, political, economic and historical frameworks, along with uses of research and forecasting; were tied with 8% each. Ethical issues, legal requirements and issues, societal trends, multicultural

and global issues each accounted for 7%. Public relations history comprised 5%, with communication and public relations theory and the business case for diversity at 2% each, and organizational change and development along with marketing and finance at 1% each. (See Table 3)

With a total N of 360 from the undergraduate organizational communication textbooks (see Table 4), the analysis identified the largest amount or 36% of the subheadings as communication and persuasion. Relationships and relationship building comprised 11% of subheading coded, followed by multicultural and global issues, along with communication and persuasion concepts and strategies each accounting for 9%. Eight percent of subheadings fell under communication and public relations theory. Societal trends counted for 7%; the business case for diversity for 6%; with various world, social, political, economic and historical frameworks for 5%. Organizational change and development comprised 4%; with uses of research and forecasting, ethical issues, and marketing and finance each at 1%. Finally, legal requirements and issues and public relations history were coded at less than 1%.

Discussion

Public Relations Textbooks

Results of the content analysis suggested that the undergraduate public relations textbooks most often addressed (at 10% or more) the knowledge categories of communication and persuasion concepts and strategies, management concepts and theories, and relationship and relationship building. The new category added in the 2006 Commission's recommendations; various world, social, political, economic and historical frameworks; was represented with 8%. Given the category's newness, this was a surprising finding.

Another surprising finding was very little emphasis on change and development or marketing and finance. The business

case for diversity and communication, and public relations theory, were also given little emphasis. However, given that the business case for diversity is a new category from the 2006 Report, it is worthy of note that it was addressed by 2% of the subheadings.

Organizational Communication Textbooks

Results of the content analysis suggested that the undergraduate organizational communication textbooks most often addressed (at 10% or more) the knowledge categories of management concepts and theories, and relationships and relationship building. The new categories added in the 2006 Commission's recommendations; business case for diversity, and various world, social, political, economic and historical frameworks; were moderately represented. This is noteworthy given the newness of the categories.

Five knowledge categories were addressed at 1% or less. The five were uses of research and forecasting, ethical issues, marketing and finance, legal requirements, and public relations history. The only logical category for exclusion was public relations history, which it was.

Organizational Communication Content as Complementary and Supplementary to Public Relations Content

The results show that public relations education at the introductory level can be significantly complemented by content within the introduction to organizational communication textbooks in the knowledge category of management concepts and theories. The total N between both sets of textbooks analyzed was 861. The public relations texts addressed management concepts and theories at a level of 7%. The organizational communication texts addressed management concepts and theories at a level of 15%.

To a much lesser degree the organizational communication texts provided complementary materials in all of the other knowledge categories except in use of research and forecasting, ethical issues, marketing and finance, legal requirements and

public relations history. These five categories were not significantly addressed in any way by the organizational texts.

Comparison of Present Results to 2001 Results

There were three notable changes in the amount of coverage given to knowledge categories by the public relations texts analyzed in the present study when compared to the 2001 study (see Table 5). The most significant level of increased coverage was given to one category, that of management concepts and theories. Two knowledge categories were addressed to a pronounced lesser degree. Those two categories were societal trends, and communication and persuasion concepts and strategies.

There were three significant differences in the level at which knowledge categories were addressed by the organizational communication textbooks in the present study when compared to the results of the 2001 study (see Table 6). A substantive increase was noted in the coverage of management concept and theories. At the same time, coverage of two knowledge categories was recorded at a reduced level. Those areas were communication and persuasion concepts, and relationship and relationship building, with the largest drop recorded in coverage of communication and persuasion concepts.

A possible explanation for the recorded changes in coverage of knowledge categories may be the fact that upon visual comparison, the subheadings in the all six textbooks analyzed in the present study had undergone notable editing and modifications when compared to those in the sister texts analyzed in the 2001 study.

Conclusion

The content analysis performed demonstrates that the competencies in public relations and organizational communication are not mutually exclusive. This reinforces the value of Zorn's (2002) suggestion for modifying degree programs

to include the designing of majors around communication competencies. Because the social constructions of public relations and organizational communication have and continue to share complementary and supplemental competencies as identified by the two most recent of the Commission on Education, interdepartmental and interdepartmental cooperation is necessary to ensure these competencies are adequately presented and reinforced. Our own department encourages students to take the introductory courses in public relations and organizational communication for both degree programs. Thus, we seek to maintain a focused body of knowledge and skill in a unique program, yet recognizing that students need to acquire a comprehensive set of competencies that are facilitated through one or more sub-disciplines.

The following are some suggestions based upon our analysis of the introductory course materials in public relations and organizational communication. First, faculty in sub-disciplines of communication should locate benchmark competencies in professional organizations such as IABC, NCA, PRSA, and sub-groups like the Commission on Public Relations Education for guidance in defining and comparing a core set of communication competencies for particular degree programs. Second, faculty need to carefully analyze courses in complementary sub-disciplines with a department and/or related academic unit within the university to enhance the comprehensive coverage of specified competencies. Third, when textbook revisions have taken place faculty need to review and recognize changes in content that may impact the presentation of complementary and supplementary competencies desired in course outcomes. Finally, collaboration through information sharing is required to foster the modification of curricular offerings in the sub-disciplines of communication.

Table 1

Commission's knowledge categories 1999

1999 Knowledge categories

- Communication and persuasion concepts and strategies including mass media, organizational, small group and interpersonal channels of communication
 - Communication and public relations theory, including public relations' role in society and in an organization
 - Relationships and relationship building
 - Societal trends
 - Ethical issues
 - Legal requirements and issues
 - Marketing and finance
 - Public relations history
 - Uses of research and forecasting
 - Multicultural and global issues
 - Organizational change and development
 - Management concepts and theories
-

Table 2

Commission's knowledge categories 2006

2006 knowledge categories (p. 43)

- Communication and persuasion concepts and strategies
 - Communication and public relations theory
 - Relationships and relationship building
 - Societal trends
 - Ethical issues
 - Legal requirements and issues
 - Marketing and finance
 - Public relations history
 - Uses of research and forecasting
 - Multicultural and global issues
 - The business case for diversity [emphasis added]
 - Various world social, political, economic and historical frameworks [emphasis added]
 - Organizational change and development
 - Management concepts and theories
-

Table 3

2006 Commission’s knowledge categories by subheadings in introductory public relations texts N=501

• Communication and persuasion concepts and strategies	20% (n=101)
• Management concepts and theories	13% (n=64)
• Relationships and relationship building	12% (n=61)
• <i>Various world social, political, economic and historical frameworks</i> [emphasis added]	8% (n=42)
• Uses of research and forecasting	8% (n=41)
• Ethical issues	7% (n=38)
• Legal requirements and issues	7% (n=38)
• Societal trends	7% (n=37)
• Multicultural and global issues	7% (n=35)
• Public relations history	5% (n=26)
• Communication and public relations theory	3% (n=16)
• <i>The business case for diversity</i> [emphasis added]	2% (n=8)
• Organizational change and development	1% (n=5)
• Marketing and finance	1% (n=5)

Table 4

2006 Commission's knowledge categories by subheadings in
introductory organizational communication texts N=360

• Management concepts and theories	36% (n=132)
• Relationships and relationship building	11% (n=41)
• Multicultural and global issues	9% (n=34)
• Communication and persuasion concepts and strategies	9% (n=32)
• Communication and public relations theory	8% (n=29)
• Societal trends	7% (n=24)
• The business case for diversity [emphasis added]	6% (n=22)
• Various world social, political, economic and historical frameworks [emphasis added]	5% (n=18)
• Organizational change and development	4% (n=14)
• Uses of research and forecasting	1% (n=5)
• Ethical issues	1% (n=4)
• Marketing and finance	1% (n=3)
• Legal requirements and issues	0% (n=2)
• Public relations history	none

Table 5
1999 Commission's knowledge categories by subheadings in
introductory public relations texts N=432

• Communication and persuasion concepts and strategies including mass media, organizational, small group and interpersonal channels of communication (2008 study: 20%, n=101)	32% (n=140)
• Societal trends (2008 study: 7%, n=37)	14% (n=60)
• Uses of research and forecasting	10% (n=44)
• Communication and public relations theory, including public relations' role in society and in an organization	8% (n=36)
• Relationships and relationship building	7% (n=29)
• Ethical issues	6% (n=26)
• Multicultural and global issues	6% (n=25)
• Public relations history	5% (n=23)
• Legal requirements and issues	5% (n=22)
• Management concepts and theories (2008 study: 13%, n=64)	4% (n=17)
• Marketing and finance	2% (n=9)
• Organizational change and development	0% (n=1)

Table 6

1999 Commission's knowledge categories by subheadings in introductory organizational communication texts N=271

• Communication and persuasion concepts and strategies including mass media, organizational, small group and interpersonal channels of communication (2008 study: 9%, n =32)	29% (n=80)
• Management concepts and theories (2008 study: 36%, n=132)	18% (n=50)
• Relationships and relationship building (2008: 11%, n=41)	17% (n=36)
• Communication and public relations theory, including public relations' role in society and in an organization	12% (n=32)
• Organizational change and development	11% (n=29)
• Societal trends	8% (n=23)
• Multicultural and global issues	2% (n=5)
• Uses of research and forecasting	1% (n=3)
• Ethical issues	1% (n=2)
• Legal requirements and issues	1% (n=1)
• Marketing and finance	none
• Public relations history	none

References

- Cheney, G. & Christensen, L. (2001a). Public relations as contested terrain: A critical response. In R.L. Heath (Ed.). *Handbook of public relations* (pp. 167-182). Thousand Oaks: Sage.
- Cheney, G. & Christensen, L. (2001b). Organizational identity: Linkages between internal and external communication. In F. Jablin & L. Putnam (Eds.), *The new handbook of organizational communication: Advances in theory, research, and methods* (pp. 231-269). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Cunconan, T. & Hansen-Horn, T. (2001). *Moving students toward integrative skill: redressing traditional assumptions of difference between organizational communication and public relations*. Paper presented to the PR Division of the National Communication Association Convention.
- Cutlip, S.M.; Center, A.H. & Broom, G.M. (2006). *Effective public relations* (8th ed.). NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Cutlip, S.M.; Center, A.H. & Broom, G.M. (2000). *Effective public relations* (9th ed.). NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Eisenberg, E.M., Goodall, H.L., Jr. & Trethewey (2007). *Organizational communication: Balancing creativity and constraint* (5th ed.). Boston & NY: Bedford/St. Martin's.
- Heath, R. (Ed.). (2001). *Handbook of public relations*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

- Kazoleas, D. & Wright, A. (2001). Improving corporate and organization communications: A new look at developing and implementing the communication audit. In R. Heath (Ed.), *Handbook of public relations* (pp. 471-478). Thousand Oaks: Sage.
- Miller, K. (2006). *Organizational communication: Approaches and processes (4th ed.)*. US: Wadsworth.
- Miller, K. (1999). *Organizational communication: Approaches and processes (2nd ed.)*. US: Wadsworth.
- Newsom, D.; Turk, J.; & Kruckeberg, D. (2007). *This is PR: The realities of public relations*, U.S.:Wadsworth.
- Newsom, D.; Turk, J.; & Kruckeberg, D. (2000). *This is PR: The realities of public relations*, U.S.:Wadsworth.
- Papa, M.J., Daniels, T.D. & Spiker, B.K. (2008). *Perspectives on organizational communication (5th ed.)*. USA: Brown & Benchmark.
- Public Relations Education for the 21st Century: A Port of Entry. (October 1999). The Report of the Commission on Public Relations Education. www.natcom.org.
- Springston, J. & Keyton, J. (2001). Public relations field dynamics. In R.L. Heath (Ed.). *Handbook of public relations* (pp. 115-126). Thousand Oaks: Sage.
- Wilcox, D.; Ault, P.; Agee, W.; & Cameron, G. (2000). *Public relations strategies and tactics (6th ed.)*. NY: Longman.
- Wilcox, D.; Cameron, G.; Ault, P. & Agee, W. (2007). *Public relations strategies and tactics (8th ed.)*. NY: Pearson A and B.

Zorn, T. (2002). Converging within divergence: Overcoming the disciplinary fragmentation in business communication, organizational communication, and public relations. *Business Communication Quarterly* 65, (2), 44-53.

Tricia Hansen-Horn (Ph.D. Purdue University) is an associate professor of public relations at the University of Central Missouri, where she also serves as the coordinator for the public relations program. Hansen-Horn's long-term professional interests lie in education excellence, image management and theory development.

Terry Cunconan(Ph.D. University of Oklahoma) is Professor and Chair of the Department of Communication at the University of Central Missouri in Warrensburg, MO. His teaching, research, and consulting interests are focused in the area of applied communication within agencies, institutions, and organizations.

¹ The Report of the Commission on Public Relations Education (October 1999), "Public Relations Education for the 21st Century: A Port of Entry" was downloaded on September 15, 2000 from the National Communication Association Web site, www.natcom.org.

² The Report of the Commission on Public Relations Education (2006), "Public Relations Education for the 21st Century: The Professional Bond" was obtained from the Public Relations Society of America in printed and bonded form.

³ The top three selling introductory public relations textbooks were selected on anecdotal evidence. No publisher would share that information directly with us. The top three organizational communication textbooks were selected on a report from a major publisher. The public relations textbooks used were Cutlip, Center & Broom (2000); Newsom, Turk & Kruckeberg (2000); and Wilson, Ault, Agee & Cameron (2000). The organizational communication textbooks used were Daniels, Spiker & Papa (1997); Eisenbeg & Goodall (2001); and Miller (1999).

⁴ The most recent versions of each textbook used in the 2001 study were included in this study. The public relations textbooks used were Cutlip, Center & Broom (2006); Newsom, Turk & Kruckeberg (2007); and Wilcox, Cameron, Ault & Agee (2007). The organizational communication textbooks used were Papa, Spikers & Daniels (2008); Eisenberg, Goodall & Trethewey (2007); and Miller (2006).

Confucianism in South Korean Drama
Yangyang Sun, Kevin Ellis, and Randy K. Dillion

Abstract

Culture can be transmitted and observed in a variety of ways. A culture's popular culture is one such example. In this essay, Ancient Confucian ethical concepts, such as benevolence, love, and familial obligations, impact the story lines in popular South Korean dramatic soap operas. In turn, young viewers of these dramas carry on the traditions and ancient ideals handed down for generations.

In today's "Information Age," philosophical concepts can be effectively transmitted in a number of new ways. The recent twentieth century gave birth to several new media through which ideas can spread across cultures, such as television programs and the internet. Although the means of transmitting these concepts have changed, many of the messages behind the new media are recycled from ancient philosophies. Often, these new media are used to circulate traditional ideals that are already prevalent in a given culture.

The integration of new media and traditional ideals can be seen in many of today's popular South Korean drama series. These often interesting and sometimes in depth Korean dramas have become quite popular among viewers from several East Asian countries, and abound. In many ways, these programs can be likened to American soap operas, in that they are comprised as a series of several episodes, each with detailed character development and interaction. The dramas' devoted audiences eagerly await each new update in their favorite shows, and are constantly being influenced by the ideas portrayed through this new media.

The purpose of this essay is to take a look at ways in which the messages of ancient Chinese philosophies are still transmitted

in Korean dramas today, and how this affects the viewers as a form of popular culture. In many ways, these viewers become a culture all their own, and the ideological ties between the nations of Korea, China, Japan and others are woven tighter by these dramas. It is essential to examine a wide range of sources, and each of which will demonstrate how these ancient messages are circulated through this development in modern media. This is necessary to understand how these ideas are still communicated among a wider popular television audience. Many U.S. American students today might not grasp the concepts within Confucianism, and even more are unfamiliar with Korean dramas; therefore, they should learn about this popular cultural phenomenon in order to better communicate with Korean drama fans worldwide.

The theme of a several South Korean dramas is similar and transcend in a way to move hundreds of thousands of people in Eastern Asia. It is truly amazing to see how the profound classic philosophies are still working vibrantly in today's fast-paced society, especially in China. In order to do so properly, a number of sources must be reviewed to obtain a grasp on the Chinese philosophies, and how they are communicated through this new medium. Additionally, one must look at how these dramas affect the communication of their fan base, and gain insight from them to further understand this media phenomenon and how to communicate with them effectively on an intercultural level.

There is a great deal of information out there about every aspect of South Korean dramas, and their effects. Generally speaking, the dramas themselves can be considered a product of East Asian popular culture. Therefore it is crucial to view the South Korean drama through the lens of popular culture study. Although there are also a number of sources on popular culture as a general field of study, Martin and Nakayama's (2008) text *Experiencing Intercultural Communication* dedicates an entire chapter to popular culture and intercultural communication. As Martin and Nakayama explain, popular culture has four important characteristics: it is produced by culture industries; it is distinct

from folk culture; it is ubiquitous; and it serves as a social function (p. 190). Naturally, the South Korean dramas possess all four of these characteristics. These media-industry produced dramas create their own culture by the messages they send to their audiences in South Korea, China, Japan, and abroad. This culture can be identified separately from the folk culture in these countries, although similar philosophical themes do exist. It is because of these similar themes that the dramas have their social function. They exist to reinforce ancient Chinese beliefs as well as entertain, and certainly can be accessed anywhere.

But to truly understand the message behind South Korean dramas, one must have a general understanding of several Chinese ideologies, but most notably Confucianism. To gain this understanding, researchers could turn to a number of textbooks, including *The Chinese Mind*, edited by Charles Moore. This book contains a phenomenal section which takes the time to summarize several different Chinese philosophies, and how the various belief systems intermingle with each other.

Moore (ed 1967) eloquently describes Chinese philosophy as “an intellectual symphony in three movements” (p.31). Confucianism naturally was born within the first “movement,” and Moore addresses this particular school of thought in great detail. Confucianism stems from the teachings of Confucius, a great 5th century B.C.E. philosopher who shaped Chinese ideology forever. His Confucian Analects serve as one of the best original sources in Chinese history, detailing many of his beliefs.

Often times, the main Confucian themes generated in the South Korean dramas are centered on Confucius’s ethical concepts. In an article on how Confucian ethics affect technical communication in Asian countries, an author by the name of Dragga writes:

Goodness (benevolence, love, or humanity) is the most important of the virtues...the goodness offered to others is determined, however, according to the benefits one has received from others. Thus the obligation to one’s

mother and father (who have given life itself) exceeds one's obligation toward brothers and sisters, friends and neighbors, city and country (Dragga, 1999, p. 367).

Many of these values are prevalent in South Korean drama and are simultaneously both the products of the existing culture in Korea along with factors that reinforce Confucian ideology and communicate them to new audiences.

This emphasis on family helps build a greater fan base for the dramas. South Korean popular dramas usually depict young individuals in an urban setting, but their emphasis on family values help bring the dramas into the homes of older people as well (Lindsay, 2003. p. 170). In this way, the dramas reach people ranging in ages from eight to 108; thus creating their own culture of fans. In fact, Jennifer Lindsay's *Babel or Behemoth: Language Trends in Asia* discusses this as part of a new communication phenomenon. Watching these shows can help bring families together, creating a common interest that anyone can enjoy regardless of age.

There are of course several other factors that help make the South Korean dramas as popular as they are. One such site known as Anime Cubed at <http://www.animecubed.com/korean-drama/> is a fan website that provides a place for South Korean Drama fans to read synopses of their favorite South Korean drama series in English. One particular article dares to declare that the most popular and best of the South Korean dramas is the one entitled *Full House* (Anime Cubed, 2007). *Full House*, like other dramas of its genre follows a certain formula and has several characteristics that help make it popular.

South Korean dramas like *Full House* feature plots that are deeply emotional, and moving. The actors frequently cry that result in instilling feelings of sympathy among the audience members. Quite often the dramas depict an international setting, such as London, Paris, or cities in the United States. This particularly interests younger audiences because it offers them an extra look into Western culture as depicted by the South Korean

producers. The actors not only dress fashionably, they often play several sports that are considered fashionable, such as golf, skiing, and fishing. Their language usage is very forward, and most of the characters have jobs that appeal to younger audiences such as portraying fashion designers or popular music artists.

As mentioned earlier one of the features that help South Korean dramas gain in popularity are the often deep thoughts they provoke, as they transmit a number of complex ideas to their viewers, including those of Confucian origin. No matter how fashionable a character may look, he or she is still driven by their innate goodness. The actors show a willingness to help others that doubtlessly has a positive social impact upon their viewers. These genuinely brilliant actors are regularly accompanied by popular music rifts often sung in foreign languages such as Spanish or English. All these different elements not only help create a strong fan base for South Korean dramas, they also play a part in creating and influencing a culture that has built up around them.

Although they are sometimes compared with U.S. American soap operas, the “dramas” of the U.S. hardly share the same wide impact that can be seen in the fan base of South Korean drama. These dedicated fans come together across several cultures to share in these same programs—especially in South Korea, China, and Japan but also in numerous other East Asian countries, and even places in the United States and other countries where die hard fans live. The dramas are acted out in the Korean language and subtitles have to be employed for Chinese and Japanese fans to enjoy. The use of subtitles always requires a little more patience among the viewers, but devoted South Korean drama fans do not seem to mind.

The fact that this culture is shaped by the messages in the South Korean dramas themselves cannot be doubted. Moreover, the messages communicated through their favorite shows actually alter the way the audience members communicate even amongst themselves. In many ways, these television programs assist the persistence of the collectivist mindset in many of these East Asian

nations. Martin and Nakayama (2008) define collectivism as the tendency to focus on the goals, needs, and views of the in group rather than individuals' goals, needs, and views. This type of viewpoint can affect a person's communication on countless different fronts—in the workplace, at home, among friends and family, and even in the governmental or social structure.

The constant representation of Confucianism in the South Korean dramas and other sources has a lot to do with generating specific social interactions. Confucius was primarily concerned with molding his students into proper people. Doing so required a great deal of respect, benevolence, and wisdom. Additionally, he also emphasized that one must learn his or her place in their given society. In this way, society is meant to function as one unit, which gave rise and legitimacy to millennia of often absolutist imperial rulers in China, and other surrounding nations. To this day, the people of China and elsewhere are attracted to strong centralized leadership, and this has its doubtless effects on both the interpersonal and social communications which dedicated South Korean drama fans engage in.

The South Korean dramas not only affect the ways in which people communicate amongst themselves, they also factor into the exchanges between nations, and impact people's intercultural attitudes. June W. Rhee, and Chul-joo Lee (2005) looked at how the South Korean dramas have changed the Chinese attitude towards their South Korean neighbors. Their article "Cross-Cultural Interactions through Mass Media Products in Northeast Asia" appropriately discusses several detailed regional surveys that explain this intercultural occurrence. Rhee and Lee found that Korean culture permeates particularly in the Chinese capital of Beijing, and not so strongly in its sister city of Shanghai. Its results are ultra-specific and difficult to describe, as they are regularly represented by mathematical formulae. But upon reviewing the study, the researchers concluded incontrovertibly that the South Korean drama had its effects on their results. Generally speaking, South Korean dramas help facilitate greater

positive attitudes towards the nation of South Korea from the people in neighboring China.

China is of course not the only nation which views South Korea in a more positive light because of the presence of South Korean dramas. Florida State University professor Suekyung Lee writes, “Now Korean dramas are sweeping over Asia. Turn on any television in Japan, Taiwan, Singapore or the Philippines and you are sure to see a Korean drama series or two on primetime” (Lee, 2006, p. 3). The article also takes the time to detail many of the same kind of findings that Rhee and Lee (2005) as well as other scholars had discovered before in China. These South Korean dramas are seen as “top fare” in Asian programming captivating audiences across the globe in a fashion that is hardly seen even in larger markets such as the United States.

The popular culture phenomenon of South Korean drama is indeed quite unique to this region of Eastern Asia. Although television programs are obviously prevalent in any popular culture, South Korean dramas in particular reach out to a tremendously large audience. Only in today’s Information Age could such a fantastic distribution of media occur. Because they are easily accessible in several countries, ancient Chinese ideals such as Confucianism are still spread throughout the region and beyond. This plays a part in maintaining a culture that has been primarily collectivist in nature for over two and a half millennia, and will no doubt continue to be so for quite some time.

References

- Dragga (1999). Ethical intercultural technical communication: Looking through the lens of Confucian ethics. *Technical Communication Quarterly*. 8, 365-382.

- Lee, S. (2006). The Korean wave in Japan: Winter sonata and its implications through audience perception.. *International Communication Association*. 1-27.
- Lindsay, J (2003). *Babel or behemoth: Language trends in Asia*. Singapore: National University of Singapore Press.
- Martin, J.N. & Nakayama T.K. (2008). *Experiencing intercultural communication: An introduction*. New York, NY: McGraw-Hill.
- Moore, C.A. (Ed.) (1967). *The Chinese mind: Essentials of Chinese philosophy and culture*. Honolulu, HI: East-West Center Press.
- Rhee, J.W. & Lee, C.J. (2005). Cross-cultural interactions through mass media products in northeast Asia. *International Communication Association*. 1-35.
- Unknown Author (2007). Full House-Korean drama and more at anime cubed. Retrieved November 29, 2007, from Anime Cubed Web site: <http://www.animecubed.com/korean-drama/>

Yangyang Sun and Kevin Ellis both studied at Missouri State University, Springfield, MO. Yangyang returned to China after completing a study abroad program in the United States. She is a graduate of Qingdao University in the People's Republic of China. Kevin graduated from Missouri State University in May 2008 with a degree in Communication. Dr. Randy K. Dillon is a Professor in the Department of Communication, Missouri State University, Springfield, MO.

**“Defending the Defenseless”:
Paul Hill’s Justification for Killing Abortion Doctors**
David L. Sutton

Abstract

I examine an essay entitled "Defending the Defenseless," a text published on the Internet and attributed to anti-abortion activist Paul Hill. In it, Hill advocates the use of deadly force against abortion providers. I seek to answer the following research question: How does Paul Hill use rhetoric to manufacture a particular reality for himself and for his audience, a reality in which the use of deadly force against abortion providers is the only conceivable means of stopping legal abortion in America?

Paul Jennings Hill became the first person executed in the United States for anti-abortion violence on 3 September 2003. In November 1994 a Pensacola, Florida, jury found the former Presbyterian minister and father of three children guilty of the July 1994 shotgun murders of Dr. John Bayard Britton, a physician who worked at an abortion clinic in that city, and James Herman Barrett, a retired Air Force officer who was a volunteer bodyguard for Britton. After losing his automatic appeals to the Florida state supreme court, Hill waived any future legal appeals. He proclaimed to the very end of his life that his actions were justified and that "he would be forgiven by God for killing to save the unborn" ("Antiabortion Militant Executed," 2003, p. A03. See also "Abortion Clinic Case," 2003; Crary, 2003; Goodnough, 2003; and Hamburg, 1994).

In this study, I examine a text published on the Internet and attributed to Paul Hill (2003) entitled "Defending the Defenseless." This text is copyrighted August 2003, one month before Hill's execution. It is a revised version of an earlier print essay written by Hill (2001) entitled "Killing Abortion Providers Is Justifiable

Homicide." Contained in the approximately fourteen printed pages of "Defending the Defenseless" is Hill's first-person narrative of the shooting and his murder trial interspersed with his anti-abortion rhetoric. Foss (1989) argued that the "impetus for criticism" is a question that a critic seeks to answer "about how rhetoric operates, and criticism is done in an effort to discover the answer" (p. 191). For this study, I seek to answer the following question: How does Paul Hill use rhetoric to manufacture a particular reality for himself and for his audience, a reality in which the use of deadly force against abortion providers is the only conceivable means of stopping legal abortion in America. Stephen Toulmin (1958) wrote, "An argument is like an organism" (p. 94). In "Defending the Defenseless," Hill rhetorically constructed a reality for himself and his audience based on a simple argument, one that has a main "organism" and five supporting claims. The body of this argument "organism" consists of the main proposition that killing abortion doctors is justifiable homicide, a position that Hill advocated in the earlier print version of this essay (Hill, 2001), as well as in statements he made to the press (Bumpus-Hooper, 1994; Koppel, 1993; Martinez, 1995). Serving as the argument organism's supports are five foundational claims: (1) the unborn are fully human; (2) doctors who perform abortions are less than human; (3) the law of God is greater than human law; (4) God sanctions the use of violence; and (5) the necessity defense is the applicable legal principle. This argument may appear awkward to others, but to Hill it was so undeniable in its truth and validity that he was willing to follow it to his death. Within Hill's reality the political, ethical, and philosophical complexities surrounding the abortion issue are nonexistent.

"Defending the Defenseless" appears with other writings attributed to Hill on a Web site sponsored by a group calling itself The Army of God. Risen and Thomas (1998) noted that this label is the "favorite *nom de guerre* for the anti-abortion movement's violent fringe" (p. 4). Indeed, a visitor to this organization's Web site (armyofgod.com) is immediately confronted with images of

aborted fetuses printed below several short Bible verses. Scrolling down the page, past a hyperlink promising more images of aborted fetuses, a visitor comes to a large picture of a smiling man with pale skin, dark circles around his eyes, and dressed in the kind of bright orange clothing that one associates with state prisons. The caption identifies the man as "Paul Hill--American Hero." There are other violent anti-abortion activists featured on this Web site in a separate section entitled "Heroes of the Faith": John Salvi, who was convicted of two counts of first-degree murder and five counts of armed assault with intent to murder after his December 1994 attacks on two abortion clinics in Brookline, Massachusetts (Daly, 1996); Eric Rudolph, who was sentenced to two life terms without parole after pleading guilty to the bombing of an abortion clinic in Birmingham, Alabama, in January 1998, severely injuring a clinic nurse and killing an off-duty police officer (Dewan, 2005; Walton and Temple, 2005); and James Kopp, who was sentenced to 25 years to life for killing Dr. Barnett Slepian with a single rifle shot through a kitchen window of the doctor's house in Amherst, New York, in October 1998 (Kopp gets maximum, 2003). This organization's Web site contains no direct call to action, no overt appeal to its followers to commit arson, assassination, bombings, or other acts of violence against abortion providers. But wherever the line is between an implicit threat and an explicit one, the Army of God is standing there with its metaphorical toes right up against it.

Abortion is a topic that has received much attention from scholars representing various perspectives within the field of communication studies. For example, Dubriwny (2005) offered a case study of a rhetorical event of second wave feminism, the Redstockings' 1969 abortion speak-out, to illustrate a theory of collective rhetoric. Gregg (1994) examined the 1992 presidential election and how the abortion issue, functioning as a synecdochic representative of "family values," influenced the rhetorical strategies of the Clinton and Bush campaigns. Hershey and Holian (2000) studied how journalists construct explanations for election

results, in particular how the abortion issue affected the newspaper coverage of the 1990 gubernatorial elections. Using Kenneth Burke's dramatic cycle, Lake (1984) argued that anti-abortion rhetoric is "ultimately grounded in alleged sexual Guilt" and "posits childbearing and legislating against abortion as twin paths to Redemption" (p. 426). Lomicky and Salestrom (1998) explored the implications of a 1996 federal appellate court decision that addressed the public interest dilemma (informed political debate versus the welfare of children) resulting from the broadcast of television advertisements that contained abortion images during the 1992 federal election. Olasky (1988) presented an historical retrospective of public relations campaigns from the 1930s to the 1960s that were designed to gain acceptance of legalized abortion. Packard (2000) suggested that appellate courts construct a more rigorous test for what speech acts constitute a "true threat" in order to offer abortion protestors greater constitutional protections. Press and Cole (1995) based their study on focus groups interviews to explore how women who identify themselves as pro-life argue their position on abortion and how these women reacted to the portrayal of abortion in the popular media. Railsback (1984) traced the public arguments about abortion through the 1960s and 1970s and identified seven distinct stages through which these arguments have evolved. Schiappa (2000) employed a rhetorical approach to argumentation to present a case study of *Roe v. Wade*, focusing on an analysis of the arguments over the definitions of "person" and "human life." And finally, Vanderford (1989) furthered the understanding of vilification as a rhetorical strategy in social movements with a detailed examination of pro-life and pro-choice rhetoric in Minnesota from 1973 to 1980.

What these previous studies have not examined are the arguments that people construct to validate their acts of violence against abortion providers. Paul Hill is not the first anti-abortion activist who has advocated for and resorted to violence. Condit (1990) examined the rhetorical strategies used by a group of four young people who fire-bombed three Pensacola, Florida, abortion

clinics in December 1984. The group members, all under the age of twenty, called their violent act the Gideon Project, emulating the biblical story of Gideon, an intensely faithful religious character who served God by destroying the shrine of the false god Baal under cover of night (p. 155). The group members shared a core belief "that God opposed abortion as murder and that God had told them to act to end abortions" (p. 156). The group's ideology was "Christian and anti-feminist," and was "in its pure form, the underlying ideology of the Right-to-Life movement as a whole" (p. 158). Despite this shared ideology, local anti-abortion movement leaders condemned the group's actions. Condit wrote: "Ideological content may enable, but it is not a sufficient cause of violence" (p. 158). Condit proposed that two additional factors were necessary to propel the Gideon Project group members to violence. The first factor is the use of a rhetorical tactic known as "over-weighing." Using this tactic, rhetors "attempt to show that the values and interests on their side carry more weight than those of the opposition," and thus the opposition's arguments can be ignored (p. 159). During the 1980s the discursive struggle between the anti-abortion and pro-abortion movements reached a standstill. Each side clung to its strongest positions and was unwilling to alter their stance and move towards a compromise. When such a situation develops, Condit wrote, then 'over-weighing'--the claim that one's values outweigh those of the opposition and so necessitate a complete sacrifice of the opposing values--is virtually the only strategy open" (p. 159). The danger of adopting this rhetorical strategy is how quickly it can lead activists away from the time-honored and respected means of persuasion and argumentation to the use of coercion, unlawful behavior, and even violence. Condit wrote: "One's own grounds become the sole values; therefore, any means are justified to secure those ends" (p. 160). For the members of the Gideon Project obedience to God over-weighed obedience to the laws protecting private property; therefore, fire-bombing an abortion clinic became an accepted means of stopping abortion. In applying this concept to the rhetoric found in

"Defending the Defenseless," Hill clearly takes the position that the life of the fetus over-weighs the life of a doctor who performs abortions, and obedience to the will of God over-weighs any duty to obey the laws of a secular government grown tyrannical; therefore, Hill concluded, killing doctors who perform abortions is the only logical means of stopping legal abortion in the United States.

The second factor Condit (1990) suggested that propelled the Gideon Project members to violence was "their personal experience of discursive closure" (p. 161). Once the members decided that their values over-weighed all others, they refused to communicate with anyone who disagreed with them, even their fellow anti-abortion protestors. Condit wrote: "Speaking only together, without any external constraining discourses, they built for each other an ideology in which God literally called them to violence" (1990, p. 161). In reading "Defending the Defenseless," one can see that Paul Hill existed within a closed discursive community. He claims that the idea for shooting Dr. Britton came to him while he was working alone (p. 2). He conducted his protest activities at Britton's clinic alone, rarely interacting with other protestors (p. 17). In the days leading up to the shooting, he discussed his plans with no one, not even his wife (p. 20). Sociologists who have studied anti-abortion groups confirm Condit's observation that a closed discursive community is a factor that steers non-violent protestors to violence. Blanchard (1994) suggested that a critical variable in determining the level of a person's activism in the anti-abortion movement is that individual's "degree of encapsulation" (p. 88). The term encapsulation "refers to the lack of ties to individuals and groups that hold opposing or even disinterested perspectives on the issue of abortion" (p. 87). People who are involved in anti-abortion educational and lobbying efforts are likely to have professional and other social "cross-pressures" that act as constraints on their behavior. Homemakers with small children may engage in picketing, but will generally refrain from activities where arrest and imprisonment are a

possibility. Activists who engage in bombing, vandalism, and arson are individuals who "tend to be almost totally encapsulated, limiting their relationships to groups who affirm their anti-abortion position and their radical actions" (p. 88). Maxwell (2002) studied anti-abortion activists engaged in Pro-life direct action and discovered that the definition of this term varied from activist to activist. They all agreed that the goal of direct action was "rescuing"--that is, attempting to stop specific, planned abortions from taking place" (p. 80). Maxwell stated that as early as the 1970s some proponents of direct action had concluded that killing abortion doctors was a logical means of ending legal abortion in the United States. These protestors never acted on that conclusion because they frequently attended small group meetings with other anti-abortion protestors whose law-abiding, middle-class, cultural heritage and philosophical commitments to peace and justice precluded murder (p. 80). Beginning in the 1980s, the number of direct action groups increased. These new groups were comprised largely of protestors who were willing to go beyond the traditional direct action activities of picketing, sidewalk counseling, sit-ins, and clinic blockades. These more radical activists had little interpersonal contact with more moderate peer groups or with the national leadership of the anti-abortion movement. Maxwell wrote: "Eventually the Gandhian ethic was abandoned so completely that a major rescuers' magazine carried an article that argued, 'The Biblical evidence used to support nonviolent civil disobedience also logically supports violent civil disobedience'" (p. 80). The author of the article cited by Maxwell was Paul Hill (1993).

After a close reading of "Defending the Defenseless," I am convinced that there is much more going on rhetorically than Paul Hill over-weighing opposing values and existing within a closed discursive community. I argue that Hill rhetorically constructed a reality for himself and his readers with an argument comprising a main proposition, i.e., that the killing of abortion doctors is justifiable homicide, and five supporting foundational claims: (1) the unborn are fully human; (2) doctors who perform abortions are

less than human; (3) the law of God is greater than human law; (4) God sanctions the use of violence; and (5) the necessity defense is the applicable legal principle.

**Foundational Claim #1:
The unborn are fully human.**

Hill (2003) never uses the word "fetus" in his essay. His preferred terms are "the unborn" or "unborn children," which he uses interchangeably with the term "children." For Hill, they are not distinct classes of humanity but one and the same. On the morning of the shooting, Hill writes of his personal resolve "to do everything in my power to prevent John Britton from killing any children that day" (p. 1). Hill was determined to see that "the clinic door would not close and lock behind the abortionist--protecting him . . . as he dismembered over thirty unborn children" (p. 1). Within the reality that Hill has rhetorically constructed for himself and his audience, legalized abortion is mass murder, and the government is playing an active role in the continuance of this atrocity by not allowing citizens to intervene. He offers an illustration to his readers by asking them to imagine "a machine gunner . . . taking aim on bound peasants, huddled before a mass grave," and no one is allowed to save them. Hill writes: "It's as though the police are holding a gun on you, and forcing you to submit to murder--possibly the murder of your own child or grandchild" (p. 8). To those who would argue that killing a doctor who performs abortions is itself a case of murder, Hill offers this rebuttal: "As distasteful as it is to kill a murderer, isn't it infinitely more repulsive to allow him to murder, not just one or two, but hundreds and thousands of unborn children?" (p. 11). As he considered the ramifications of his own plan to shoot Dr. Britton, Hill concluded that shooting Britton would have several positive results, the greatest being that it "would bear witness to the full humanity of the unborn as few other things could" (p.14). Wounding Dr. Britton was not an acceptable option because, after

recovering from his wounds, Britton would probably return to his clinic and "kill thousands of unborn children" (p. 36).

Hill provides his audience with no evidence to support this first claim. He offers no citations to any philosophical, scientific, or theological authorities who argue for the full humanity of the human fetus. For Hill this claim is self-evident. However, advocating this position does not place Hill on the fringe of the anti-abortion movement. Many of the nationally recognized anti-abortion groups operate from the same foundational premise, e.g., the United States Conference of Catholic Bishops. In a statement commenting on the thirtieth anniversary of the 1973 U.S. Supreme Court's decision in *Roe v. Wade*, the bishops wrote: "Ultrasound and other medical advances have made possible a greater appreciation of the humanity of the unborn child (2002, p. 8). One has difficulty imagining how this foundational claim standing alone can serve as a justification for an act of violence, especially murder. Indeed, the argument-as-organism model would show that one claim/appendage does not provide adequate support for the main body/proposition. However, with the formulation of his second foundational claim, Hill begins to build that supporting structure and also move himself more towards the outer edge of the anti-abortion movement.

**Foundational Claim #2:
Doctors who perform abortions are less than human.**

As Paul Hill (2003) discusses the circumstances of the shooting, he only twice refers to Dr. John Britton by name. In the majority of instances when Hill writes about Britton, he refers to him in the third person. Britton is not "a medical doctor who performs abortions" but merely an "abortionist." In the reality that Hill has rhetorically constructed for himself and his audience, this repeated use of an impersonal term serves to move Dr. Britton down a level in the social hierarchy to below the status of full humanity.

Hill states that the idea of using lethal force against Britton first came to him one afternoon as he was working at his small business of washing cars at dealerships and used car lots. Hill writes: "During the next two or three hours, as I continued to work in a distracted manner, I began to consider what would happen if I were to shoot an abortionist" (p. 2). After his work day had ended, he spent the rest of that evening mulling over the idea: "I continued to secretly consider shooting an abortionist, half hoping it would not appear as plausible after I had given it more thought" (p. 16). The next morning, Hill went to the abortion clinic in the early morning hours. After some "discrete questioning" he "discovered that the abortionist had arrived a few minutes *prior* to the police security guard" (p. 17). Over the weekend prior to the shooting, Hill formulated a plan to hide a weapon in a rolled-up protest sign and "leave the concealed shotgun on the ground until the abortionist drove past me into the clinic driveway" (p. 30). On the morning of the shooting, Hill prayed as he waited in the driveway of the clinic for Britton to arrive. Hill states that his prayers were answered when "the abortionist arrived two to three minutes prior to the police guard. When I lifted the shotgun, two men were sitting in the front seats of the parked truck; Jim Barret, the escort, was directly between me and the abortionist" (p. 38). Though he was arrested within minutes of the shooting, Hill considered his mission to be accomplished: "Not only had the abortionist been prevented from killing about thirty people that day, he had also been prevented from continuing to kill--unlike other abortionists who have merely been wounded and have returned to 'work'" (p. 41).

In formulating this second foundational claim, Hill relies on a common rhetorical tactic used throughout history, especially the history of warfare, that of dehumanizing one's enemy. The historian Frances Fitzgerald (1972) writes that American soldiers fighting in Vietnam were "an Orwellian army, they knew everything about military tactics, but nothing about where they were or who the enemy was" (p. 495). For the Americans fighting

in Vietnam all Vietnamese were "gooks." Fitzgerald quotes an American soldier: "And when you shot someone you didn't think you were shooting at a human. They were a gook or a Commie and it was okay, 'cause, like . . . they'd do it to you if they had the chance" (p. 496). David Hackworth (2002), who commanded an infantry battalion during the Vietnam War, confirms Fitzgerald's observations. He writes that many of his soldiers did not consider the Viet Cong to be human, "even the name *gook* was part of the dehumanizing process. . . . And if the VC weren't humans, then there was no problem wasting, zapping, and otherwise terminating them" (p. 133).

By using impersonal terms such as "gook" or "Commie," American soldiers in Vietnam overcame their reluctance to kill other human beings. Likewise, in continuously using the impersonal term "the abortionist," Hill dehumanizes Dr. Britton, placing him at an inferior level within the human social hierarchy. The resulting logic is straightforward: If doctors who perform abortions are below the status of full humanity, then they can be denied the privilege of life. In the reality that Hill rhetorically constructs for himself and his audience, he did not shoot a medical doctor who performed a controversial but legal surgical procedure; instead, he was defending the lives of innocent children against a dangerous, subhuman monster. With the first two appendages attached, Hill's argument organism has some means of locomotion but still is unable to stand upright on its own. What it needs are more appendages, which Hill provides to his readers by addressing the superiority of God's law over human law.

Foundational Claim #3:
The law of God is greater than human law.

According to Hill (2003), the current American government is illegitimate because it allows abortion and protects abortion providers. A government that permits abortion "throws a blanket of fear and intimidation over all its citizens" and directs "its

intimidating weaponry at any who dare to interfere with the slaughter" (p. 46). A government's most powerful instrument in managing dissent is "fear of the police," which "has a paralyzing effect on both the individual and the collective mindset that is incalculable" (p. 46). Hill's solution to this state of affairs is to reject the rule of human law and to obey a higher authority. He writes: "The scriptures teach that when the government requires sin of its people that they ' . . . must obey God rather than men'" (p. 9).

Hill places himself in the role of a prophet. Kenneth Burke (1984) wrote that within any human organization there is a conflict between priests and prophets. Priests are "members of a group who are specifically charged with upholding a given orientation," who "devote their efforts to maintaining the vestigial structure" (p. 179). Prophets, on the other hand, "seek new perspectives whereby this vestigial structure may be criticized and a new one established in its place" (p. 179). Hill sees legalized abortion as a great evil that has engulfed the land, and the socially accepted means of protest have failed to end it. The government and its priesthood--the police, prosecutors and judges--are disobeying God's law by protecting doctors who perform abortions. By assuming the role of a prophet, Hill believes that he must act in accordance with God's law, a law that is superior to any human law. He is commanded by God to stop abortion by any means necessary, up to and including the use of deadly force. For example: "I could not hope for a better opportunity than the one immediately before me. God had opened a window of opportunity, and it appeared that I had been appointed to step through it" (p. 18). A second example: "I was not standing for my own ideas, but God's truths . . . Who was I to stand in God's way? He now held the door open and promised great blessing for obedience. Was I not to step through it?" (p. 28). And a final example: [Hill tells his wife] . . . "I didn't have a choice! That cry came from the depths of my soul. I was certain, and still am, that God called me to obey His revealed will at that particular time" (p. 29). Perhaps the most poignant example of Hill envisioning himself as a prophet comes in a section of the essay entitled

"Remembering God's Promise." Hill describes taking his family to the beach the weekend prior to the shooting. Watching his children at play, he continues to think about his plan to shoot Dr. Britton. As he realizes that his actions will mean a permanent separation from his family, he becomes overwhelmed with emotion. In an effort to maintain his self-control, Hill begins to pray:

As I lifted my heart and eyes upward, I was reminded of God's promise to bless Abraham, and grant him descendants as numerous as the stars in the sky. I claimed that promise as my own, and rejoiced with all my might, lest my eyes become clouded with tears and betray me (p. 22).

Later in that same section, Hill writes of carrying his children one at a time into the ocean with them clinging to his neck. As the water rose over their heads, Hill writes that "it was though I was offering them to God as Abraham offered his son" (p. 23).

Hill justifies his third foundational claim about the superiority of God's law over human with an implied authoritative warrant. In the reality that Hill has rhetorically constructed for himself and his readers he speaks *ex cathedra*; therefore, we must defer to him on this crucial theological matter because only he can hear the voice of God, only he can correctly interpret the word of God, and only he can see with unmatched clarity what God wants done about abortion in America. But I would argue that there was no *vox Dei* calling to Paul Hill as he washed cars on that July 1994 afternoon in Pensacola, no experience analogous to a burning bush in the desert or a blinding flash of light on the road to Damascus. A significant portion of the facts as Hill presents them in "Defending the Defenseless" simply do not add up. For example, Risen and Thomas (1998) wrote that Hill's involvement in the anti-abortion movement began during his seminary days, his views becoming more reactionary and strident as time passed. The national anti-abortion organization Operation Rescue "and local activist leaders in Pensacola feared that Hill was either an FBI plant or mentally unbalanced, and they sought to distance themselves from him" (p.

346). In early July 1994, after attending a three-day anti-abortion seminar in Kansas City, "everything began to click into place for Hill" (p. 362). Hill questioned other protestors at The Ladies Center in Pensacola and learned about Dr. Britton's schedule. He bought "a solid black 12-gauge Mossberg shotgun with an extended magazine and short barrel" and "prepared for his attack by loading and reloading his new gun" (p. 363). As Hill practiced in his house, he accidentally discharged his weapon, "blowing a hole in the wall" (p. 363). On 29 July 1994, at 6:45 a.m., Hill stationed himself in front of the abortion clinic, "concealing his shotgun in a large tube that normally contained posters he used for his protests," and waited for Dr. Britton to arrive. The subsequent details of the shooting are described in vivid and gory detail by Risen and Thomas (1998, pp. 363-365), but they are noticeably absent from Hill's version of events (2003, p. 31-39). This alleged prophet can describe in intimate detail his conversations with God, but cannot (or refuses) to recount for his readers a single blood-soaked detail of the actual deed he was called by God to perform.

Normally, such a discrepancy would be a fatal flaw in any narrative; however, I would argue that for Hill and those who sympathize with his cause the narrative is true enough to be accepted as a reality. In an analysis of President Ronald Reagan's political rhetoric, Lewis (1987) noted that Reagan relied mainly on story-telling as a means of presenting his administration's policy arguments. Reagan's stories "were presented sometimes as fiction and sometimes as fact" (p. 288). This inconsistency was maddening to Reagan's critics but was mostly overlooked by a majority of the American people. The reason for their acceptance, Lewis argued, is that Reagan's stories contained the quality of "narrative truth": "If the story is not true, it must be true-to-life; if it did not actually happen, it must be evident that it could have happened or that, given the way things are, it should have happened" (p. 288). I see the third supporting claim of Hill's argument organism as one based on this concept of narrative truth. Other people in history have claimed to have heard the voice of

God calling them to battle against some great evil. So in the reality that Paul Hill rhetorically constructs for himself and his readers why could it not happen again?

In defining humans as symbol-using animals, Kenneth Burke contends that we are "goaded by the spirit of hierarchy (or moved by the sense of order)" (1966, p.16). Because humans cling to this notion that everything around them, including each other, must be placed in some kind of order--from lowest to highest, from good to better to best, from third place to second place to first place--the entire human social structure, Burke stated, is "differentiated, with privileges to some that are denied to others" (1966, p. 15). With his first three foundational claims, Hill arranges the human fetus, doctors who perform abortions, and human law on various levels of the human social hierarchy, whereupon he can bestow the privilege of life to some and deny it to others. Hill's fourth foundational claim, that God sanctions the use of violence, may be the most troubling as it runs counter to the God commonly understood as a God of love.

**Foundation Claim #4:
God sanctions the use of violence.**

Hill expresses no doubt that killing Dr. Britton would be a good thing, and he presents his readers with a list of benefits that would come from Britton's death. Using deadly force against "an abortionist" would: give "credibility, urgency, and direction to the pro-life movement which it has lacked, and which it needs to prevail" (p. 12); "put the pro-life rhetoric about defending the born and unborn children equally into practice" (p. 14); "bear witness to the full humanity of the unborn as few other things would" (p. 14); "open people's eyes to the enormous consequences of abortion--not only for the unborn, but also for the government that had sanctioned it, and those required to resist it" (p. 14); "convict millions of their past neglect, and also spur many to future obedience" (p. 14); "help people to decide whether to join the

battle on the side of those defending abortionists, or the side of those defending the unborn" (p. 14); and "uphold the truths of the gospel at the precise point of Satan's current attack (the abortionist's knife)" (p. 15). In the reality that Hill rhetorically constructs for himself and his audience there is a conflict raging between Christians and the forces of evil. This is not a symbolic confrontation, the stuff of temperate sermons in quiet suburban churches; this is a literal, full-scale, worldwide war. Legalized abortion is a point of weakness, Hill contends, a place "where the enemy has broken through" (p. 15). By killing Dr. Britton, Hill anticipated that other anti-abortion activists, especially other Christians, would rally to his side because he had demonstrated that evil could be defeated in a direct manner. Hill writes: "I was certain that if I took my stand at this point, others would join with me, and the Lord would eventually bring about a great victory" (p. 15). In the battle against the forces of evil, according to Paul Hill, God uses whatever tools are at hand to ensure victory, up to and including deadly force.

In an attempt to provide support for this fourth foundation claim, Hill offers two pieces of evidence. First, Hill presents his readers with an expanded interpretation of the Sixth Commandment. This commandment is not a simple prohibition against murder, Hill posits, but carries with it an additional obligation that God's people are required to honor, namely that they must use whatever force is necessary to prevent murder, including deadly force. Hill writes: "When the government, thus, will not defend the people's children--as required by the Sixth Commandment--this duty reverts to the people" (p. 9). As he has done before, Hill offers no expert testimony from any philosophical, legal, or theological sources to support this assertion that the Sixth Commandment carries additional duties. Again he speaks to his readers *ex cathedra*; for him the truth of this assertion is self-evident.

Hill's second piece of evidence comes in the form an interpretation of two stories from the Old Testament, one from

Esther (p. 13, p. 48) and the other from Genesis (p. 52, p. 55). The story of Esther is one of political intrigue in the royal court of the Persian king Ahasuerus (or Xerxes in the Greek). The plot "moves with great power toward the climax, which is the victory of the Jews over their enemies in Persia. This event is then celebrated and the day set aside for annual commemoration in the Feast of Purim" (Bjornard, 1971, p. 2). The moral of the story from Esther, Hill contends, is that it is "not unwise or unspiritual . . . to use the means that God has appointed for keeping His commandments; rather, it is presumptuous to neglect these means and expect Him to work apart from them" (p. 13). The "means" to which Hill refers is violence. In the second story from Genesis, Abram (later to be known as Abraham) receives news that his nephew Lot and his family have been captured and carried off by warring kings. Abram takes his best trained men and pursues his nephew's captors, attacks them at night, and returns Lot and his household to Sodom. Later in the story, Melchizedek "an actual priest-king functioning in Jerusalem, ministering to both Gentiles and Abram, the Hebrew" blesses Abram's actions with an offering of bread and wine (Francisco, 1973, p. 162). Hill argues that the lesson we should draw from this story is that "we must be willing to postpone our ordinary duties, and make the personal sacrifices necessary to save the innocent. He goes on to argue that "God's word requires it" (p. 58). In other words, Paul Hill wants his fellow Christians to follow Abram's example, to put aside whatever it is that occupies them at the moment and be prepared to use violence to defend the unborn. They need not worry about any earthly consequences; the sacrifice of Melchizedek shows that God will bless their actions.

Instead of questioning the validity of Hill's biblical hermeneutics, a more useful question from a rhetorical perspective would be the following: Does this discourse provide Paul Hill and his readers with "a reliable, trustworthy, and desirable guide to thought and action in the world"? (Fisher, 1985, p. 351). The answer is clearly that it does not. What Hill is advocating in "Defending the Defenseless" is to bypass the current legal and

political process, which he views as corrupt, and use violence to accomplish one's goals. Ted Koppel (1993) made a similar observation in the 8 December 1993 *Nightline* interview with Hill, when he confronted Hill with the ethical implications of his argument. Koppel's stated:

One of the things, of course, and you've just alluded to it, that defines a society as civilized in one form or another is, even though a society may feel the need to kill in its own defense, or individuals sometimes are called upon to kill in their own defense, a civilized society assigns that task to an army, to a police force. You are advocating now a form of vigilantism. You're not satisfied with the way society is dealing with it, and so you're setting yourself above society in this case.

A portion of Hill's response to Koppel:

God has given us this responsibility, and, if we stand by with our hands in our pockets and watch, say, our wives kill our unborn children and can do nothing about it, then we are actually culpable of not trying to prevent murder. And sometimes, as I said, we're not trying to be violent. We're saying 30 million children have died and sometimes you have to use force, as the police use force to stop a murderer, sometimes you have to use force to stop people from killing innocent children. And that's what historic Christianity has always believed.

There was a degree of absolute certainty that Hill enacted in his delivery asserting the rightness and morality of his position, i.e., that God sanctions the use of violence to end the practice of abortion. One finds the same level of conviction in "Defending the Defenseless" when Hill proclaims "you must respond to the call of Christ--even if it requires you to leave your children, wife, house, and also forfeit your life" (p. 49). Again he is playing the role of a prophet, again he is speaking to us *ex cathedra*.

We now have four appendages attached to the argument organism, which in the natural world would give a creature an appearance of stability and locomotion. Hill includes one more foundational claim, which appears in the concluding paragraphs of his essay.

**Foundational Claim #5:
The necessity defense is the applicable legal principle**

Hill formulates his final claim in the concluding sections of his essay (p. 53-64). Most people are mistaken, Hill contends, when they think that their response to abortion is restricted to prescribed legal boundaries. Hill states that "the appropriate response to an immediate threat to a child's life is not to merely pursue possible educational and legislative remedies, but to do what is necessary for the child's immediate and effective defense" (p. 53). Hill equates abortion with the crimes of rape and mass murder. If we were to witness such crimes being perpetrated by government forces on a massive scale against an ethnic minority, with thousands of people being killed in the streets of our cities, would we not be compelled to do something in their defense? Would acts of violence not be justified? Hill writes: "If individuals are wrong to bomb abortion clinics, would it have also been wrong for individuals to have bombed the tracks that led to Auschwitz?" (p. 54). Hill maintains this line of reasoning when he describes his criminal trial, which he labels "a classic example of judicial tyranny" that "bore many similarities to the trials of those who protected the Jews from being murdered in Nazi Germany" (p. 60). Hill writes that he failed in his attempt to use the defense of justifiable homicide. With the help of two anti-abortion lawyers, Hill crafted a legal brief in which he argued that the shooting of Dr. Britton was "necessary to prevent mass murder." Included in this brief was a reminder to the judge that "he might, one day, stand trial for upholding the abortion holocaust if he would not

allow us to present the truth" (p. 61). The judge rejected this argument, and Hill was not allowed to present this defense at trial.

I would argue that what Hill calls justifiable homicide is actually the necessity or choice of evils defense. This justification defense is defined in several ways by various legal authorities. For example, in *Corpus Juris Secundum* one finds that the necessity defense is "based upon an avoidance of imminent, significant injury and a contention that defendant's illegal conduct can be justified if he engaged therein to avoid a danger, harm, or penalty occasioned by such conduct" (Culligan, 1989, p. 57). Further, in order for this defense to be available, it must be shown that the accused individual's conduct was "necessitated by a specific and imminent threat of injury or harm, which the accused was without blame in occasioning or developing" in a situation that left the accused with "no reasonable, legal, and viable alternative" and the accused "reasonably anticipated or believed in the direct causal relationship between [the] conduct and the harm to be averted" (Culligan, 1989, pp. 57-58). In *Black's Law Dictionary* one finds a more succinct definition of necessity: "A person is excused from criminal liability if he acts under duress of circumstances to protect life or limb or health in a reasonable manner and with no other acceptable choice" (Black, 1979, p. 929). As with all things in the legal field, the concept of necessity is a continuing topic of debate among legal scholars (e.g., Bohlander, 2006). However, in the reality that Paul Hill rhetorically constructs for himself and his readers, things always appear with a crystalline clarity. The only reasonable alternative available to Hill in stopping Dr. Britton from performing abortions was to shoot and kill him. For Hill not being allowed to present this particular defense was proof enough that he was denied a fair trial. He writes: "Since I was denied a truthful defense, I had none. What was I to say? Since I could not tell the truth, I had almost nothing to say" (p. 61).

After the jury found him guilty, he was taken to the Florida prison system's death row. Hill waived all future appeals after the Florida State Supreme Court upheld his death sentence (p. 67). On

Tuesday, 2 September 2003, Hill gave a last interview in which he stated, "I expect a great reward in heaven" and "I am looking forward to glory." The following day he had final visits with family members and was served a last meal. A spiritual advisor remained close by until the scheduled execution time of 6:00 p.m. Paul Hill was pronounced dead at 6:08 p.m. ("Antiabortion Militant Executed," 2003).

Conclusion

According to Foss (1989), before we can consider an act of rhetorical criticism complete, we must answer one final question: To what degree is a rhetorical artifact "a model of or meets the standards of effective rhetorical practice"(p. 194). Hill was confident that the act of killing Dr. Britton would lead to some kind of mass uprising. Likeminded individuals from across America would use whatever force was necessary, including deadly force, to end the practice of abortion once and for all. Although some were concerned that Hill's sympathizers would engage in a fresh round of violence following his execution ("Abortion clinics fear fallout", 2003), nothing of the sort ever happened. One might conclude that Hill's rhetoric did not meet the standards of effective rhetorical practice because he failed to accomplish his goal of inspiring large numbers of people to join his cause. On the other hand, must a rhetor inspire the multitudes in order to be judged as effective? As the events of Oklahoma City in April 1995 and the World Trade Center in September 2001 demonstrate, a small group of fanatical individuals can cause destruction on a massive scale in an attempt to accomplish their goals.

As a result of conducting this study, I find myself in agreement with those who argue that we must come to accept violence as a predictable aspect of the American political scene, and that we have no choice but to do what we can to protect ourselves while we wait for each successive storm to pass.

Ginsburg (1998) noted that when activists "feel themselves stymied, regardless of their position on the ideological spectrum, violence comes to be seen as a political resource in the interest of hastening a purportedly utopian vision of society" (p. 237). There may have been a pause in anti-abortion violence after the execution of Paul Hill, but I am convinced that violent acts against abortion providers will inevitably begin again. Rosen (2006) predicted that if the *Roe v. Wade* decision were to be overturned, it "would probably ignite one of the most explosive political battles since the civil-rights movement, if not the Civil War" but "that when the dust settles, in five or ten or thirty years, early-term abortions would be protected and late-term ones restricted" (p. 56). But what might happen if *Roe v. Wade* is not overturned? I believe we will see the more radical elements of the anti-abortion movement portray Paul Hill as a martyr for the cause, use his act of killing Dr. Britton as an example for others to follow, and find inspiration in the closing argument from his trial: "May God help you to protect the unborn as you would want to be protected" (2003, p. 66).

References

Abortion clinic case: Killer of 2 executed. (2003, September 4).
The New York Times, p. A1.

Abortion clinics fear fallout after Paul Hill=s execution. (2003, September 4). *USA Today*. Retrieved 22 September 2003 from http://www.usatoday.com/news/nation/2003-09-04-clinics_x.htm

Antiabortion Militant Executed for Killings. (2003, September 4).
The Washington Post, p. A03. Retrieved 12 February 2004 from <http://www.washingtonpost.com/>

- Bjornard, R. B. (1971). Esther. In C. J. Allen (Ed.), *The Broadman Bible Commentary* (Vol. 4, pp. 1-21). Nashville: Broadman Press.
- Black, H. C. (1979). *Black's law dictionary* (5th ed.). St. Paul: West.
- Blanchard, D. A. (1994). *The anti-abortion movement and the rise of the religious right: From polite to fiery protest*. New York: Twayne.
- Bohlander, M. (2006). Of shipwrecked sailors, unborn children, conjoined twins and hijacked airplanes--taking human life and the defence of necessity. *Journal of Criminal Law*, 70, p. 147-161.
- Bumpus-Hooper, L. (1994, July 30). Slaying suspect preached that killing was justified to halt abortions. *The Orlando Sentinel*, p. A7. Retrieved 22 November 2005 from NewsBank InfoWeb database.
- Burke, K. (1966). *Language as symbolic action: Essays on life, literature, and method*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Burke, K. (1984b). *Permanence and change: An anatomy of purpose* (3rd ed.). Berkeley: University of California Press. (Original work published in 1935)
- Condit, C. M. (1990). *Decoding abortion rhetoric: Communicating social change*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press.
- Crary, D. (2003, August 29). Martyr to a few, murderer to others, Paul Hill faces execution. *Naples Daily News*. Retrieved 22 September 2003 from <http://naplesnews.com/>

Culligan, L. J. (Ed.). (1989). *Corpus juris secundum*. St. Paul: West.

Daly, C. B. (1996, March 19). Salvi convicted of murder in shootings. *The Washington Post*, p. A01. Retrieved 21 March 2005 from <http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-srv/local/longterm/aron/salvi021996.htm>

Dewan, S. (2005, July 19). Victims have say as Birmingham bomber is sentenced. *The New York Times*, p. A14.

Dubriwny, T. N. (2005). Consciousness-raising as collective rhetoric: The articulation of experience in the Redstockings' abortion speak-out of 1969. *The Quarterly Journal of Speech*, 91, 395-422.

Fisher, W. (1985). The narrative paradigm: An elaboration. *Communication Monographs*, 52, 347-367.

Fitzgerald, F. (1972). *Fire in the lake: The Vietnamese and the Americans in Vietnam*. New York: Vintage Books.

Foss, S. K. (1989). Rhetorical criticism as the asking of questions. *Communication Education*, 38, 191-196)

Francisco, C. T. (1973). Genesis. In C. J. Allen (Ed.), *The Broadman Bible Commentary* (Vol. 1, pp. 101-288). Nashville: Broadman Press.

Ginsburg, F. (1998). Rescuing the nation. In R. Salinger (Ed.), *Abortion wars: A half century of struggle, 1950-2000* (pp. 227-250). Berkeley: University of California Press.

- Goodnough, A. (2003, September 4). Florida executes killer of an abortion provider: Supporters of inmate call him a martyr. *The New York Times*, p. A16.
- Gregg, R. B. (1994). Rhetorical strategies for a culture war: Abortion in the 1992 campaign. *Communication Quarterly*, 42(3), 29-43.
- Hackworth, D. (2002). *Steel my soldiers' hearts: The hopeless to hardcore transformation of 4th battalion, 39th infantry, United States Army, Vietnam*. New York: Rugged Land.
- Hamburg, J. (1994, November 3). Jury finds Hill guilty in clinic murders: The jury took only 20 minutes to reach a verdict about the deaths of a Pensacola abortion doctor and his escort. *The Orlando Sentinel*, p. A1. Retrieved 22 November 2005 from NewsbankOnline database.
- Hershey, M. R., & Holian, D. (2000). Constructing explanations for U.S. state governors' races: The abortion issue and the 1990 gubernatorial elections. *Political Communication*, 17(3), 239-262.
- Hill, P. J. (1993, August). Who killed the innocent? Michael Griffin or Dr. David Gunn? *Life Advocate*, 40-43.
- Hill, P. J. (2001). Killing abortion providers is justifiable homicide. In L. Knapp (Ed.), *Current controversies series: The abortion controversy* (pp. 115-125). San Diego, CA: Greenhaven Press.
- Hill, P. J. (2003, August). Defending the defenseless. Retrieved 24 October 2003 from http://www.armyofgod.com/PHill_ShortShot.html

- Kaiser, O., & Kümmel, W. G. (1981). *Exegetical method: A student handbook*. New York: Seabury Press.
- Kopp gets maximum for killing abortion MD. (2003, April 9). *USAToday.com*. Retrieved 21 March 2005 from http://www.usatoday.com/news/nation/2003-05-09-kopp-maximum-abortion-md_x.htm.
- Koppel, T. (Correspondent). (1993, December 8). *Nightline* [Television broadcast]. Washington, D.C.: ABC News.
- Lake, R. A. (1984). Order and disorder in anti-abortion rhetoric: A logological view. *Quarterly Journal of Speech, 70*(4), 425-443.
- Lewis, W. F. (1987). Telling America's story: Narrative form and the Reagan presidency. *Quarterly Journal of Speech, 73*, 280-302.
- Lomicky, C. S., & Salestrom, C. B. (1998). Anti-Abortion advertising and access to the airwaves: A public interest doctrine dilemma. *Journal of Broadcasting & Electronic Media, 42*(4), 491-506.
- Marinez, C. (1995, May 13). The journey from minister to murderer: In an interview from prison, Paul Hill talks about his descent from preacher to activist to killer of an abortion doctor and an escort. *The Tampa Tribune*, p. 4 (Plant City section). Retrieved 22 November 2005 from NewsBank InfoWeb database.
- Maxwell, C. J. C. (2002). *Pro-life activists in America: Meaning, motivation, and direct action*. New York: Cambridge University Press.

- Olasky, M. (1988). Engineering social change: triumphs of abortion public relations from the thirties through the sixties. *Public Relations Quarterly*, 33(4), 17-21.
- Packard, A. (2000). Threats or theater: Does Planned Parenthood v. American Coalition of Life Activists signify that tests for "true threats" need to change? *Communication Law & Policy*, 5(2), 235-267.
- Press, A. L., & Cole, E. R. (1995). Reconciling faith and fact: Pro-life women discuss media, science and the abortion debate. *Critical Studies in Mass Communication*, 12(4), 380-402.
- Railsback, C. C. (1984). The contemporary American abortion controversy: Stages in the argument. *Quarterly Journal of Speech*, 70(4), 410-424.
- Risen, R., & Thomas, J. L. (1998). *Wrath of angels: The American abortion war*. New York: Basic Books.
- Rosen, J. (2006, June). The day after Roe. *The Atlantic Monthly*, 56-66.
- Rust, E. C. (1981). *Religion, revelation & reason*. Macon: Mercer University Press.
- Schiappa, E. (2000). Analyzing argumentative discourse from a rhetorical perspective: Defining 'person' and 'human life' in constitutional disputes over abortion. *Argumentation*, 14(3), 315-332.
- Silva, M. (1987). *Has the church misread the Bible?: The history of interpretation in light of current issues*. Grand Rapids: Zondervan.

Spong, J. S. (1991). *Rescuing the Bible from fundamentalism: A bishop rethinks the meaning of scripture*. New York: HarperCollins.

Toulmin, S. E. (1958). *The uses of argument*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

United States Conference of Catholic Bishops. (2002, November 12). A matter of the heart: A statement on the thirtieth anniversary of Roe v. Wade. Retrieved 30 August 2004 from <http://www.usccb.org/prolife/heart.htm>

Vanderford, M. L. (1989). Vilification and social movements: A case study of pro-life and pro-choice rhetoric. *Quarterly Journal of Speech*, 75(2), 166-182.

Walton, V., and Temple, C. (2005, April 14). Abortion drove bomber to kill. *The Birmingham News*, pp. A1, A8.

David L. Sutton, Associate Professor, Department of Communication & Journalism, Auburn University. An earlier version of this manuscript was presented at the annual convention of the Southern States Communication Association in April 2004 and the annual convention of the National Communication Association in November 2004.

**Exploring the Use of Media and Technology
by Religious Institutions**
Shonna L. Tropf, Ph.D.

Abstract

Seemingly, technology would have little to no place in the traditional world of religion. However, the world depends on technology to aid in communication as never before. Are religious institutions any different? Can religious institutions survive in today's technologically advanced world without embracing technology to some extent? Many religious institutions have willingly and enthusiastically embraced the use of media and technology as a way of better communicating with their congregations, sharing messages, and creating meaning. However, other religious institutions have resisted incorporating media and technology into their worship services for various reasons; traditional values being one. This paper will explore if and how religious institutions across the country use media and technology within their worship services.

Religion is one of the primary foundations of human civilization. It is a place where people create understanding and meaning in their lives and the world around them. Religion is tradition in the truest sense. Seemingly, technology would have little to no place in the traditional world of religion. However, the world depends on technology to aid in communication as never before. Are religious institutions any different? Can religious institutions survive in today's technologically advanced world without embracing technology to some extent? Many religious institutions have willingly and enthusiastically embraced the use of media and technology as a way of better communicating with their congregations, sharing messages, and creating meaning. However, other religious institutions have resisted incorporating media and

technology into their worship services for various reasons; traditional values being one. This paper will explore if and how religious institutions in the metropolitan Kansas City, Missouri area use media and technology within their worship services.

The Role of Technology and Communication

William Fore (1987) describes communication as the “process in which relationships are established, maintained, modified, or terminated through the increase . . . of meaning.” Communication is essential in the construction and maintenance of relationships and aids in the development of a sense of community within a society. Fore asserts that humans develop a sense of who they are based on the communities in which they are involved. “Community, the fulfillment of effective human communication, is essential to our becoming human.”

When considering technology as a means of communication Heidegger (1977) argued the two were inextricably linked and that technology also aided in the development of the human experience. He believed that in order to understand the true significance of technology on society one had to understand what it meant to be a human being. Christians (1997) further explained Heidegger’s thoughts by writing the “meaning of technology is known through the way it works into our humanness, along with the characteristics it receives from such a grounding” (p. 68).

Heidegger is not alone in his belief that technology must be understood as it aids communication and the human existence. One (1982) also holds that the technologies used for communication are “extensions and transformers of human beings” (as cited in Fore, 1987). However, others have a slightly different view of technologies’ place in the role of society. Hood (1972) posited that technology was “extrinsic to a person’s being and society’s character.” He stated, “Technology is subordinate to practical wisdom, to moral and intellectual activities through which humans

realize their essence and stabilize society” (Hood, 1972, as cited in Christians, 1997, p. 66).

No matter the preferred perspective, the influence and impact technology has on society’s ability to communicate and the human condition can not be denied. Technology is an integral element in communication, which does in fact aid in the development of the human experience and, in turn, people’s perceptions of the world and their sense of community. Meyrowitz (1997) linked advancements in communication technologies and the changing perception of community. He wrote, “each evolution in communication forms has involved a shift in social boundaries and hence a shift in the relationship between self and others” (p. 62). Furthermore, he argued that different types of media offer different experiences for each user and that individual users will relate their experiences back to their social communities or groups (1994).

The notion of communication technology’s influence on the human experience is further explored in the Medium Theory. This theory examines the way in which variables such as how quickly a message can be dispersed by a particular medium and to how many people, how people interpret messages delivered by particular mediums, and how many senses are engaged in order to interpret messages sent by particular mediums. One of the basic assumptions of this theory is that “such variables influence the medium’s use and its social, political, and psychological impact” (Meyrowitz, 1994, p. 50). Medium theory can be examined from a micro as well as a macro level, which examines how “the addition of a new medium to an existing matrix of media may alter social interactions and social structure in general” (p. 51).

Religion and Communication

Religions are based on inspirational stories of faith. These are stories from which people can form meaning and understanding of the world around them. People form communities

based on their religious beliefs and the dissemination of such stories. Many of these stories have been told and passed down from generation to generation for thousands of years. Communication of those stories to people is one of the primary functions of religious institutions (“Churches and the News Media,” p. 6; Schement and Stephenson, 1996).

Christians view communication as a vitally important element in the life of the church (*The Churches’ Role in Media Education*). Reuver (1982) wrote that God has been communicating with humans since creation in one form or another. Many, including the National Council of Churches (NCC), take the stance that with God as the creator of all things; He gave humans the means to create communication technologies that enable them to disseminate His word through a variety methods (Fore, 1987; Reuver, 1982; www.ncccusa.org).

When determining the role of communication and communication technologies within the Church, Reuver points to Hamelink’s summaries of four official documents produced by various Christian churches. Each of these documents confirm that in the eyes of the Christian church communication and the media should be utilized to help spread the Gospel as well as an educational tool to help put Christian teachings in a context that parishioners can understand and accept (1982, p. 37).

Many other religious institutions view communication and communication technologies as essential elements in the dissemination of their God’s word. The World Association of Christian Communicators (WACC) believe communication, among other things, is key in creating a sense of community, is participatory, and helps support and develop culture (Christian Principals). The NCC determined that there are distinct social roles of communication. Such social roles include stewardship, proclaiming the news of God, and Christian witness. They go further to say that communication technologies are a gift from God that make “new experiences” possible (*The Churches Role in Media Education*, p. 7). Boomershine (1987) asserted that changes

in technology and the media can completely alter [and enhance] a community's understanding of and interaction with the "sacred" (p. 275). Similarly, Fore (1987) noted that communication is important in stewardship and that Christians should take advantage of the media and the various technologies provided by Him in order to spread the Word.

Many religious institutions have been utilizing communication technologies during worship services for years. "Sermons, sacraments, healings, offerings, blessings, and prayer are common practices in many [religious institutions], and in recent years have been mediated or disseminated to larger audiences through information technologies" (Stout, 2001, p.70). Bausch (2006) notes that while most religions are aural in nature, most of today's congregants are stimulated more visually. In addition, he asserts that using various media and technology can enhance the worship experience and reach those who had been avoiding worship services because they did not retain information from hearing alone. "There is evidence that congregations, even auditory ones, enjoy the paring of sound with sight when it is done tastefully, sparingly, gracefully, and gradually" (p. 8).

Today a number of religious institutions are utilizing media and technology as a way to "enhance and enliven worship for . . . members" (Biersdorfer, 2002). Video equipment, including cameras, projectors and large screens, computers, sound boards, and even specialty lighting are common place in many houses of worship. It's noted that this trend began in the so called "mega" Christian churches. However, today other smaller churches, as well as other religions, are embracing the use of media and technology during worship services (Bray, 2005; Biersdorfer, 2002; Dolan, 2004; Jacobson, 2005; Ray, 2000). Bryan Wilkerson, pastor of Grace Chapel in Lexington, states, "We live in a techno-savvy world. So in order for us to achieve our mission, we must be culturally relevant The power of modern technology helps us more effectively deliver the long-established message of Jesus Christ" (as cited in Bray, 2005).

While many religious institutions have been taking advantage of communication technologies during worship service for several years, many are still resistant. Reuver (1982) points out that many religious institutions are struggling with how to use such communication technologies and the media effectively (p.38). When incorporating media and technology into a worship service there are some points that need to be considered by those in charge. Postman (1985) stated, "Each medium, like language itself, makes possible a unique mode of discourse by providing a new orientation for thought, for expression, for sensibility" (p.10). Smart (1988) asserted that while the use of media and technology was valuable, the most important tools in communicating God's word are people. Authur (1997) takes this thought further by writing, "We risk losing sight of people as the most important medium of all, if we fail to take account of the full range of ways in which they express their religiousness . . ." (p. 190).

The literature suggests that technology is a vital element in communication as well as in the human experience. Communication technologies and religion shape how people relate to one another, form communities and create meaning from their world. In recent years more and more religious institutions are depending on media and technology to help disseminate information and messages to congregations. This paper examines if and how churches use media and technology during worship services.

Research questions include the following:

RQ1: Do churches use technology during worship services? If so, what type of technology are churches using and how?

RQ2: Do churches use media during worship services? If so, what type of media are churches using and how?

RQ3: Is there a difference in the types of churches using media and technology? If so, is there a

difference in how the various churches use media and technology?

RQ4: Is there a difference in the perceived effectiveness of using media and technology between those churches that do use media and technology and those that do not?

Method

Ministers from randomly selected churches were asked to fill out a survey concerning their use of media and technology during worship services. Churches were selected by dividing the US in to five regions, including the west coast, east coast, Midwest, south, and north. From those regions states and cities within those states were selected randomly from a map. Once the cities were selected the church listings from the online version of the Yellow Pages was printed. All of the churches listed within those pages were numbered. The numbers used were chosen by a computer software program designed to create a randomization algorithm.

Two hundred churches from each geographic region were selected for a combined 1000 churches. However, for various logistical reasons having to do with inadequate mailing addresses and returned packets, only 820 churches were actually asked to participate. Overall 126 surveys were completed, providing a 15% response rate. Even though this is a much smaller response rate than hoped for, it does begin to provide a look at how religious institutions are using media and technology in their worship services. Initially participants were asked to fill out an Internet survey, but were provided the option of having a hard copy of the survey sent to them. In an attempt to boost the response rate the hard copy was later sent to the sample.

To make the analysis more clear the various denominations were categorized. These categories included Denominations placed in the liturgical category included Catholic, Episcopalian, Greek

Orthodox, Lutheran, and Presbyterian. Those placed in the non-liturgical group were Assembly of God, Baptist, and Others (non-denominational). Methodist respondents were the only one placed in the neutral group. The reason for this is that services at Methodist churches can either be very traditional, very contemporary in nature, or a combination of the two.

Materials

The questionnaire was divided into multiple sections. The first section contained questions regarding church's use of technology during worship services, and how technology, specifically the Internet, was used to prepare for worship services. For this study technology was considered to be audio and visual equipment, including sound systems, cassette/CD players, video cameras, VHS/DVD players, projectors as well as computers and software programs. The second section of the questionnaire contained questions regarding if, how, and what types of media were used during worship services. For this study media was considered to be clips from documentaries, educational programs, popular television programs, movies, and news programs. This section also asked whether the churches used media in other areas besides worship, including Bible studies, Sunday school, youth groups, and small groups. The last section of this questionnaire to be discussed here contained questions regarding the leaders' of the religious institutions opinions regarding the use and the effectiveness of using media within worship services. The survey ended with demographic information regarding the age of the religious institution leader, how long he/she had been serving as a leader, the size of the religious institution, how long the religious institution had been in existence, and the overall ethnic make-up of the religious institution.

For the first two sections of the questionnaire a combination of standard yes/no (i.e., Do you use video equipment during worship services?) and multiple selection questions were used (i.e., If yes, select all that apply) For the section of the

questionnaire that dealt with the use of media within worship services a 9-item, 5-point Likert Scale was used. Options for these questions included strongly agree = 5, agree = 4, neutral = 3, disagree = 2, and strongly disagree = 1.

The first variable examined for included the particular type of denomination using media and/or technology and how they were using media and/or technology. The second variable examined for was the size of the religious institution and their use of media and/or technology. The third and final variable examined for was how the leader of the religious institution felt about the use of and the effectiveness of using media during worship services regardless of their own use of media during worship services.

Results

In order to answer RQ1 and RQ2, frequencies for each questionnaire item were analyzed. As for the use of technology by churches, all of them report using technology in some capacity during worship services. Table 1 lists the other ways in which religious institutions are using audio equipment.

Numbers were considerably lower when considering video equipment. Table 2 lists the ways in which religious institutions reported using various types of video equipment.

Seventy-eight (62.4%) of respondents reported using a computer during worship services. The most common use of those churches using a computer is displaying Biblical/spiritual text 63 (80.8%). Displaying greetings and important messages/announcements to the congregation and displaying visual imagery tied for the second most common use of a computer during worship service with 62 (79.5%) responses. Fifty-nine (75.6%) respondents use a computer to display videos. Lastly, 39 (37.2%) respondents use computers to display song lyrics.

Connected to using a computer during actual worship services was using the Internet to aid in preparing the services. Eighty-nine (71.8%) respondents reported using the Internet to

help in the preparation of worship services. Table 3 lists the ways in which churches are using the Internet to prepare worship services.

Some of the notable uses provided in “Other” category included downloading song lyrics, with 6 respondent (6.7%) and four (4.4%) respondents searching for and downloading scriptures and sermons.

When considering the use of media, approximately half reported using media during worship services. Sixty-eight (54.4%) said they used video clips during worship services. Of those respondents, thirty-six (52.9%) report using video clips less than once a month. Thirteen (19.1%) reported using video clips monthly. Using video clips every week or every other week were close with nine (13.2%) respondents using video clips every week and six (8.8%) using them every other week. Two (2.9%) respondents reported using video clip in an “other” capacity.

Fifty-five (55.6%) respondents reported using video clips in other areas besides during the actual worship service. Thirty-three (26.2%) report using media in Bible studies and twenty-seven (21.4%) during small groups. Thirty-two (25.4%) respondents use media during Sunday school and thirty-six (28.6%) during youth groups. One-hundred and nineteen (94.4%) reported in the “Other” category, with most of those saying they use video clips for their children’s worship.

The types of video clips used were broken in to five categories, including documentaries, educational programs/films, news, movies, and television programs. Table 4 lists the types of video clips religious institutions are using.

Many of the churches reported having a staff person devoted to media and technology.

When considering RQ3, there were some notable differences between the types of churches and the type of media and technology they use during worship services when cross tabulations were run. For this section of the study denominations were grouped into three categories: those churches that were

liturgical, non-liturgical, and neutral. Twenty-six churches (23.2%) were liturgical. Seventy-nine (62.7%) were non-liturgical. Twelve (9.52%) were neutral, or Methodist.

Liturgical churches use less media and technology than the other two categories. Table 5a shows the types and amounts of media and technology being used by liturgical churches.

Non-liturgical churches used more media and technology than the other two designated categories. Table 5b shows the types and amounts of media and technology being used by non-liturgical churches.

Churches designated as neutral used a medium amount of media and technology. Table 6 shows the types and amounts of media and technology being used by neutral.

Differences in the use of media and technology were also noticed when cross tabulations were run looking at the various ages of the leaders as well as the size of the congregation. Typically, the younger the leader, the more media and technology was used during worship services. Of those leaders between the ages of 20-30 all eight of the respondents used a sound system and computer during worship services and the Internet to prepare services. Seven (87.5%) use projectors. Six (75.0%) use a CD player and video clips, five (62.5%) use a DVD player, and four (50%) use video cameras. Three (37.5%) respondents in this age group use a cassette player, and a VHS machine, while one (12.5%) reports using a television.

For those between the ages of 31-50 thirty-six (92.3%) respondents reported using a sound system. Twenty-eight (87.5%) report using projectors. Twenty-five (78.1%) respondents used a DVD player, twenty-nine (76.3%) use the Internet to prepare for worship, twenty-nine (74.4%) use a CD player and twenty-eight (71.8%) use a computer during worship services. Twenty-four (61.5%) respondents use video clips. Nineteen (48.7%) use a cassette player, while fifteen (46.9%) use a VHS machine, and ten (32.3%) use cameras. Lastly, five (16.1%) use a television.

For those between the ages of 51-70, which is where the majority of respondents who reported their age fell, was overall lower, but in a few cases slightly higher. Sixty-nine (96.8%) of the respondents use a sound system, while forty-four (61.1%) use a CD player. Using a projector and the Internet are close together with forty (67.8%) and forty-eight 67.6% respectively. Using a DVD player and a computer are also close together with thirty-five (59.3%) and forty-one (57.7%) respectively, while thirty-five out of seventy-one (49.3%) use video clips and twenty-nine (49.1%) use cameras. Twenty-nine (40.3%) out of seventy-two use a cassette player. Lastly, twenty (33.9%) use a VHS machine and seventeen (28.8%) out of fifty-nine use a television.

There were four respondents over the age of 70 who used the least amount of media and technology of all the age groups. Three (75%) used a sound system and a CD player. Half of the respondents in this age group reported using a cassette player, a DVD player, projectors, cameras, video clips, and the Internet to prepare worship services. One (25%) reported using a VHS machine and no one in this age group reported using a television or a computer.

When considering the size of the religious institution, the use of media and technology was a bit more varied than by age. However, the results trended toward the larger the membership, the more media and technology used. For those churches with more than 1000 members 100% report using a sound system, a DVD player, and projectors. Eight (80%) use a sound system and the Internet. Seven (70%) report using video clips during worship services. Six (85.7%) out of seven respondent report using cameras, while six (60.0%) out of ten use a computer. Two (20.0) use a cassette player and two (28.6%) out of seven report using both televisions and VHS machines.

For those institutions with a membership between 501 and 1000 fourteen (87.5%) use a sound system. Ten (83.3%) out of twelve use projectors, while eight (66.7%) use a DVD player and cameras. Ten (62.5%) out of sixteen report using a CD player,

while eleven (68.8%) use the Internet to prepare for worship services and nine (56.3%) use a computer during worship. Eight (50.0%) use video clips and six (37.5%) use cassette players. Four (33.3%) out of twelve respondents use a VHS machine and three (25.0%) use a television.

Churches with a membership between 251 and 500 used slightly less media and technology than the above listed groups. Nineteen (95.0%) out of twenty respondents report using a sound system and eighteen (90%) use the Internet. Sixteen (80.0%) use a CD player, while fifteen (78.9%) out of nineteen use a DVD player, fourteen (73.7%) use projectors and a computer. Thirteen (65.0%) out of twenty use a cassette player and video clips, while nine (50.0%) out of eighteen report using cameras. Seven (36.8%) out of nineteen a VHS machine and five (27.8%) out of eighteen use a television.

For those churches with a membership between 100 and 250 forty-five (100%) use a sound system and twenty-four (68.6%) out of thirty-five use projectors. Twenty-nine (67.4%) out of forty-three use the Internet to prepare for worship, while twenty-six (57.8%) out of forty-five use a computer. Nineteen (54.3%) out of thirty-five use a DVD player, twenty-four (53.3%) out of forty-five use a CD player, twenty-three (52.3%) out of forty-four report using video clips. Sixteen (45.7%) out of thirty-five use cameras and thirteen (37.1%) use VHS machines. Lastly, fourteen (31.1%) out of forty-five use a cassette player and seven (20.0%) out of thirty-five respondents use a television.

The last category of membership, those with less than 100 members, used the least amount of media and technology during worship of all. Twenty-nine (87.9%) out of thirty-three use a sound system. Twenty-two (33.3%) out of thirty respondents use projectors. Twenty-four (72.7%) out of thirty-three use a CD player, twenty-two (66.7%) use a computer and the Internet, and eighteen (54.5%) use a cassette player. Eighteen (60.0%) out of thirty use a DVD player, while sixteen (48.5%) out of thirty-three

use video clips. Thirteen (43.3%) out of thirty use a VHS machine and six (20.0%) use a television and cameras.

To answer RQ4 a t-test was conducted on each of the 9-item, 5-point Likert scale measuring the minister's opinions of the effectiveness and necessity of using media during worship services. See table 7.

Discussion

The purpose of this study was to determine if and how religious institutions across the nation are using technology and media during worship services. It was discovered that all religious institutions do utilize technology in some manner. Sound systems, the Internet, and CD players were the types of technology used the most across all denominations. However, depending on the denomination, size, and age of the leader there were differences in the manner and types technologies and media being used.

One of the most interesting findings of this study was the clearly distinguishable difference in the type of technology being used by the various denominations. Churches that were noted as non-liturgical and whose worship services tend to be more free form, use more technology than any other denomination. Those denominations that are considered to be more traditional with very liturgical services, tend to use the least amount of technology.

Some debate on this matter was noticed in the comments provided by the respondents. Such written comments included, "liturgy trumps the strength of the audio and visual materials" and "liturgical worships uses sight, sound, smell and hearing through ritual and ceremonial action." On the flip side, there were many written comments that supported and praised the use of technology during worship services. Such written comments included using technology because they had a "desire to communicate, a desire to see our expected outcomes," "use it mildly to age into the media and technology age" and "I use Power Point extensively in my sermon, it is great!"

When considering the opinions of religious leaders concerning the use of media during worship services there was, yet again, clear and significant differences between those who use media and those who do not. Again, those who are not using media tended to be the religious institutions that are more liturgical in nature. The services in those types of institutions do not lend themselves to the use of media, therefore the leaders do not have a familiarity with using it, nor do they feel media use during worship is a necessary or effective means of communicating God's message. Many of the leaders who do not use media commented that using media clips could actually hinder the full experience of worship. One such respondent wrote,

In a culture that is increasingly impersonal and passive rather than active, the church often becomes increasingly impersonal with media and technology contributing to the lack of active interaction in worship. Thus, the ancient liturgies of the church provide for personal involvement of the worshippers, the sacrament of the altar gives the body and blood of Christ to each communicant personally, and the use of traditional hymns and liturgies help worshippers to know that they are part of something much larger than themselves and are continuing with Christians of all ages.

However, those leaders who did use media during worship felt strongly about its effectiveness. Likewise those leaders found media to be helpful in disseminating the word of God and that congregants enjoyed the various clips brought in to the service. Some respondents commented that they used media clips to "bring an emotional impact to our messages." Others reported using media clips to show "world needs" or to "amplify the themes."

Another interesting, if not telling, finding was the difference in the use of media and technology based on the age of the leader. Leaders in the youngest age bracket (20-30 years) used the largest variety of technology during worship services. The total use of media and technology as well as the type of technology used

trailed off as the age brackets increased. This is a direct reflection of American society. Today's youths are inundated by media messages and have access to a larger variety of technology than ever before in history. Subsequently, they are more reliant upon media and technology to aid in the communication of basic ideas and beliefs, including religious ideologies. It is my supposition that as this youngest age bracket ages, then the use of various media and communication technologies during worship services will increase in all religious institutions. This change will happen not only because congregants demand it, but because it is the only way leaders know how to effectively communicate their messages.

This study is just a beginning exploration of the use of media and technology within worship services and additional areas of ministry. It is my hope that the findings of this study spur the interest of others to examine this topic further. There were several limitations to this study that will need to be addressed for future studies. First, the response rate is very low, therefore, making it difficult to apply these results to all churches across the nation. In order to increase the response rate for a future study, a national data base of church ministers should be built. Also changing from an Internet/ mail survey to a phone survey may also help increase the response rate, providing much stronger and more generalizable results.

However, this study did show there are indeed some differences in how religious institutions utilize media and technology during worship. These differences were examined across denominations, leader's age brackets, by the size of the institution itself, and across opinions of leaders who either use media and technology or who do not. With significant difference noted within all of the variables examined in such a small sample size, it stands to reason that even greater differences would be detected in a larger study.

This is an important area of study because technology is changing the ways in which we as a society communicate. Technology is changing the nature of communities and how they

are formed. Religion is at the heart of our society and that with which many communities are formed. Therefore, technology is having an impact on religion and how religious institutions are able to effectively communicate within their communities as well as how they are able to reach outside of their communities to communicate with new members, which will enable them to grow and be sustainable in this age of media and technology.

Table 1. Types of Audio Equipment Used During Worship Services

Types of audio equipment	Frequency	Percent
Cassette Player	54	42.9
CD Player	84	66.7
Sound System	119	94.4
Other	112	88.9

Table 2. Types of Video Equipment Used During Worship Services

Type of Video Equipment	Frequency	Percent
DVD Player	68	65.4
Projectors	78	75
Television	24	23.3
VHS Players	39	37.5
Video Camera	46	44.7
Other	119	94.4
None	31	24.6

Table 3. How Religious Institutions Use the Internet to Prepare Worship Services

Use	Frequency	Percent
To find inspirational stories	60	69.8
To find accompanying visuals	57	64.0
To find clarification on subjects/topics	47	52.8
To email other religious leaders for help or clarification	19	21.3
Other	105	83.3

Table 4. Types of Video Clips Used by Religious Institutions

Type	Frequency	Percent
Documentaries	21	30.9
Educational Programs/Films	14	20.6
News	13	19.1
Popular Movies	35	51.5
Popular Television Programs	16	23.5
Other	119	94.4

Table 5a. Types of Media & Technology Used by Liturgical Churches

Type	N	Frequency	Percent
Cassettes	26	6	23.1
CD Player	26	6	23.1
Sound Systems	26	24	92.3
DVD Player	12	2	16.7
Projectors	12	3	25.0
Televisions	12	1	8.3
VHS Machine	12	0	0
Cameras	12	3	25.0
Video Clips	26	3	11.5
Computer	25	4	16.0
Internet	26	16	61.5

Table 5b. Types of Media & Technology Used by Non-Liturgical Churches

Type	N	Frequency	Percent
Cassettes	79	38	48.1
CD Player	79	64	81.0
Sound Systems	79	75	94.9
DVD Player	74	53	71.6
Projectors	74	61	82.4
Televisions	73	20	27.4
VHS Machine	74	31	41.9
Cameras	73	36	49.3
Video Clips	78	54	69.2
Computer	79	61	77.2
Internet	77	57	74.0

Table 6. Types of Media & Technology Used by Neutral

Type	N	Frequency	Percent
Cassettes	12	4	33.3
CD Player	12	8	66.7
Sound Systems	12	12	100.0
DVD Player	12	8	66.7
Projectors	12	9	75.0
Televisions	12	1	8.3
VHS Machine	12	3	25.0
Cameras	12	6	50.0
Video Clips	12	6	50.0
Computer	12	8	66.7
Internet	12	10	83.3

Table 7. Comparing Opinions of Ministers Who Use and Do Not Use Media on the Effectiveness & Necessity of Using Media During Worship Services

Item	N (Use & non- use)	Mean (use & non-use)	t-score	p-value
Enhances worship experience	Yes 65 No 48	4.1077 2.7500	7.327	.000
Engages congregation	Yes 65 No 49	4.1231 2.9796	5.699	.000
Hinders religious messages and teachings	Yes 63 No 46	4.2222 3.1304	5.940	.000
Provides examples of how to behave in certain situations	Yes 63 No 48	3.6032 2.6250	5.029	.000
Provides examples of how not to behave in certain situations	Yes 62 No 48	3.4677 2.5833	4.274	.000
Gets in the way of the real purpose of attending worship	Yes 63 No 46	4.2381 2.8043	6.962	.000
Are necessary to use in order to keep up with a congregation used to visual stimuli	Yes 63 No 46	3.2540 2.4130	3.742	.000
Provides “real life” examples that can be applied to religious doctrine/learning	Yes 63 No 45	4.0000 2.8000	5.949	.000
Are a distraction during worship	Yes 62 No 46	4.2097 2.8043	7.041	.000

References

- Authur, C. (1997). Media, meaning, and method in religious studies. In S.M. Hoover, & K. Lundby, (Eds.), *Rethinking media, religion, and culture* (184-193). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Bausch, M. (2006, January). Auditory and visual learners in the pew. *The Clergy Journal*, (7-8).
- Biersdorfer, J.D. (2002, May 16). When worship gets wired. *The New York Times*, 1G. Retrieved July 29, 2006, from EBSCOHost database
- Boomershire, T. (1987). Religious education and media change. *Religious Education*, 82(2), 269-278.
- Bray, H. (2005, July 5). Mega-churches spread the word via high-tech. *Boston Globe*. Retrieved July 29, 2006, from EBSCOHost database.
- Christians, C.G. (1997). Technology and triadic theories of mediation. In S.M. Hoover, & K. Lundby, (Eds.), *Rethinking media, religion, and culture* (65-82). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- (2006). Christian Principals of Communication. Retrieved September 24, 2006, from http://www.wacc.org.uk/wacc/about_wacc/principles.
- (1996). Churches and the news media: Telling our story. Retrieved September 21, 2006 from <http://www.nccusa.org/about/comcompolicies.html>.

- Dolan, T.G. (2004, March/April). Keeping up with the times. *Your Church*. Retrieved July 29, 2006, from EBSCOHost database.
- Fore, W. F. (1987). *Television and religion: The shaping of faith, values and culture*. New Haven, CT: SBS Press.
- Heidegger, M.C. (1977). *The question concerning technology and other essays* (W. Lovitt, Trans.). New York, NY: Harper & Row.
- Hood, W.F. (1972). The Aristotelian versus the Heideggerian approach to the problem of technology. In C. Mitcham & R. Mackey (Eds.), *Philosophy and technology: Readings in the philosophical problems of technology* (347-363). New York, NY: Free Press.
- Jacobsen, S. (2005, January). Who then will you serve? Lessons on living with technology. *The Clergy Journal*. Retrieved July 29, 2006, from EBSCOHost database.
- Meyrowitz, J. (1997). Shifting worlds of strangers: Medium theory and changes in "Them" versus "Us." *Sociological Inquiry*, 67(1), 59-71.
- Meyrowitz, J. (1994). Medium theory. In D. Crowley & D. Mitchell (Eds.), *Communication Theory Today* (50-77). Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Ong, W. J. (1982). *Orality and literacy: The technologizing of the world*. New York, NY: Methuen.
- Ray, D. (2000, July 31). High-tech enhances that old-time religion. *Insight on the News*, 16(28), 26. Retrieved July 29, 2006, from EBSCOHost database.

Reuver, M. (1982, January). The church and communication. *Ecumenical Review*, 34(1), 35-47. Retrieved July 29, 2006, from EBSCOHost database.

Schement, J.R., & Stephenson, H.C. (1996). Religion and the information society. In J.M. Buddenbaum & D.A. Stout (Eds.), *Religion and media use: A review of the mass communication and sociology literature*, (61-73). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Smart, N. (1988). Communication. In E. Barnouw (Ed.) *International encyclopedia of communication*, 3 (443-446). New York, NY: Oxford Press.

Stout, D.A. (2001). Religion and popular culture: Notes from the technological school. In D.A. Stout & J.M. Buddenbaum (Eds.) *Religion and popular culture: Studies on the interaction of worldviews*. Ames, IA: Iowa State University Press.

(1995). The churches role in media education and communication advocacy. Retrieved September 21, 2006, from <http://www.nccusa.org/about/comcompolicies.html>.

Shonna Tropf (Ph.D. University of Southern Mississippi) is an assistant professor of Broadcast Media and the Graduate Coordinator at the University of Central Missouri. She teaches a wide variety of courses including research methods and corporate video production. Tropf's primary research interests include religion in the media and political communication.

Pop Quiz/Shmop Quiz: Innovative Approaches to Assessing Students' Understanding

Laurie Melnik

Introduction: The Dreadful “Q” Word.

During my graduate career working on a Master of Fine Arts emphasizing Theatre for Young Audiences, I had a major “a-Ha!” moment about assessment: pop quizzes can be fun! Much of my study examined ways to integrate the arts in core subject areas and, although this mainly focused on K-12 schools, I found myself employing many of these “creative ideas” in the university classroom. Rather than surprise my students with short-answer questions, I would assign them an arts-based activity that would require the same set of skills needed for the dreaded pop quiz. Many of my activities assess reading comprehension and have the added benefit of revealing whether students are doing the work. I discovered that my students not only enjoyed this approach but were more likely to come to class prepared. Maybe the fear of creating something when they were not up-to-date on their reading outweighed the notion of failing a pop quiz?

In my experience, quizzes rarely register much in importance to the students because they usually make up a small percentage of the overall grade. However, when I replaced “quiz” with that of a different activity having the same goal as the “Q” word, my students performed much higher and were more willing to complete assignments. It appeared as though having the chance to celebrate their knowledge in a creative way encouraged them to complete their class work. Rarely did I have students come to class who were not caught up on their reading.

This teacher resource aims to share a few ways to assess students’ understanding when using an arts-based activity. I will share ways not only to assess a student as you would in a quiz but also activities that can be used to “test” while serving as a check-in

for the teacher. As with many arts-based activities, subjectivity can exist, and there may be times when the good ole' pop quiz is needed in order to assess students more objectively.

The activities I will be sharing were used during a Freshman Seminar based on *Saturday Night Live*. Although I will provide only two activities here, I encourage you to explore other ways an arts-based activity may provide you with an assessment of your students' understanding on a particular topic. I cannot begin to tell you how much more I have learned about my students when they have completed an arts-based activity as opposed to answering a few generic questions at the top of class. Oftentimes such discoveries about my students help me find the tools they need to succeed in my class.

Activity One: The Cup of Knowledge

This quick activity can provide the same information as a pop quiz assessing reading comprehension as well as serve as a check-in on their students' progress. The students need only a Styrofoam cup and writing utensil. Have the students decorate their cup with symbols that represent the topic, person, or issue they have read about. In my class, this assignment was used after students read a chapter about Gilda Radner and her contribution to *Saturday Night Live*. As I walked around the room, I looked for similarities as to how the cups were being decorated. I also observed the students' differing levels of engagement with the activity. However, when observing this activity, be careful about jumping to conclusions. I suggest this because a few of my students paused quite a bit during the activity. It first appeared that they were not bothering to complete their assignment, and I later discovered that these students were just reticent about their artistic ability. As a result, I factored in my Picasso equation the next time and had the students stand up and give a twenty-second blurb about what they drew on their cup, and why. It was during these

mini-presentations that I was able to assess my students' understanding of their reading the most.

Activity Two: Hacker Night Live

All students in my class were required to purchase Diana Hacker's *A Writer's Reference*. A huge goal for students participating in Freshman Seminar remains developing college-level writing skills. I felt that my class might be somewhat disjointed discussing the history of *Saturday Night Live* one week, followed by instruction on the writing of a college-level research paper the next. In order to combat this, I needed to find a way to combine the topic with the lesson, and came up with an activity where the students would perform short *Saturday Night Live* style sketches to present Hacker's book. Personally, I believe discussing grammatical structure does not provide much excitement, but this activity allowed my students to explore this topic without hesitation. They not only understood something so mundane as the function of comma, semi-colon and dash, but had a lot of fun doing so. It was refreshing to read their papers at the end of my class and find proper citation usage, no fragments or common misspelled words, correct punctuation, active voice, etc.

The sketches ranged between just three and five minutes in length, and I decided the topics. I chose topics based on reoccurring issues I found in their writing from assignments already completed in my class. Topics included: APA vs. MLA, active voice vs. passive voice, the relationship between comma, semi-colon, dash, and formal vs. informal word usage. Although my students poked fun at these topics in their sketches, they left the activity with a better understanding of what is expected when writing a college-level paper.

Conclusion

I hope that these activities provide insight regarding ways to incorporate arts-based activities in assessing your students. I continue to find ways to engage my students in a creative way, and I have discovered that offering various approaches for them to demonstrate their understanding motivates them to do their work. Frequently a student will confide to me that they “aren’t a good test taker” or that “quizzes make them nervous,” and these activities allow them to share their understanding without the perceived pressure that a “test” or “quiz” sometimes contains. I encourage you to try utilizing an arts-based activity at least once. You might just discover something about one of your students that would help them perform better in your class.

Laurie Melnik is a teaching artist and playwright who has worked with various regional theatres across the U.S. Laurie works with students across diverse populations and has presented sessions about her work at both state and national conferences. She has a Master of Fine Arts in Theatre emphasizing in Theatre for Young Audiences from the University of Central Florida and is a 2008 St. Louis Regional Arts Commission Community Arts Training alum. She is also an adjunct professor at Webster University where she continues to integrate the arts within the university classroom.